ΗΛΙΓΛΧ

BUDGET COMMITTEE (STANDING COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE ON BUDGET) MINUTES February 12, 2020

PRESENT: Councillor Russell Walker, Chair Mayor Mike Savage Deputy Mayor Lisa Blackburn Councillors: Steve Streatch David Hendsbee Bill Karsten Lorelei Nicoll Sam Austin Tony Mancini Waye Mason Lindell Smith Shawn Cleary Stephen Adams **Richard Zurawski** Matt Whitman Paul Russell Tim Outhit

STAFF:

Jane Fraser, Director of Finance & Asset Management/CFO John Traves, Municipal Solicitor Liam MacSween, Acting Deputy Municipal Clerk Krista Vining, Legislative Assistant

The following does not represent a verbatim record of the proceedings of this meeting.

The agenda, reports, supporting documents, information items circulated, and video (if available) are online at <u>halifax.ca</u>.

The meeting was called to order at 9:34 a.m., and recessed at 11:31 a.m. Budget Committee reconvened in at 1:30 p.m. Budget Committee adjourned at 3:17 p.m.

1. CALL TO ORDER

Councillor Walker, Chair called the meeting to order at 9:34 a.m. in Council Chamber, 3rd Floor City Hall, 1841 Argyle Street, Halifax.

Addition:

Information Items

1. Memorandum from the Director of Finance, Asset Management and ICT/CFO dated February 7, 2020 re: Shape Your City, Shape Your Budget 2020 – Preliminary Public Consultation Results

2. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES - NONE

3. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

Councillor Walker called three times for any members of the public wishing to address Budget Committee on the 2020/21 Budget; there were none.

4. 2020/21 Budget Adjustment List (BAL) Review

The following was before Budget Committee:

- Staff recommendation report dated February 5, 2020 with attached Budget Adjustment List by Business Unit and Budget Briefing Notes
- Presentation from the January 29, 2020 Budget Committee meeting entitled: Assessment Update
- Correspondence from James Boyer, Ron Ramsey, David Aikens, Frank Nolan, Tony Russell, Peter Milley, Chair of Regatta Point Landowners' Association, Jonathan Tyson and Ken Kelly, Donna Mossman, D'Arcy Dennehy, Judy and Mort Jackson, Donna Bourne-Tyson, Julian Beltrame, Dennis and Debbie Page, Francisco Lorenzo, Agnes McLean, Elizabeth Mills, Gail Crofton, J. Richard Hodgson, Fran Chisholm, Jo-Ann Roberts, Ron Ramsey, Pat Marr, John Wanczycki, David C. Perlmutter, Marcia DeSantis, Dr. Jessica Jackman and Holly Gillis, Wesley Petite and Madeleine Waddington, and Kassinda Tolliver on behalf of Patrick Sullivan

MOVED by Councillor Nicoll, seconded by Councillor Whitman

THAT the Budget Committee direct the Chief Administrative Officer to finalize a Proposed Budget for Halifax Regional Council approval including funding for the following:

1. Graves Oakley Park Change Room/Washroom in the amount of \$315,000 with funding coming from Contingency Reserve Q421,

2. Bus Stop Theatre Grant in the amount of \$125,000 in 2020/21 with funding coming from Contingency Reserve Q421,

3. Economic Development Strategy with Halifax Partnership in the amount of \$135,000 to be funded from Fiscal Services,

4. Provision of Menstrual Products in municipally owned community centers and partner facilities to be funded within the existing Corporate and Customer Services 2020/21 operational budget, and

5. Include any accepted items from the Budget Adjustment List to be added/removed to/from the 2020/21 Proposed Budget.

The Budget Committee agreed by consensus to vote separately on each operating over and under budget item outlined in the February 5, 2020 staff report.

MOVED by Councillor Mason, seconded by Deputy Mayor Blackburn

THAT the motion be amended to include:

6. Fund one time operating and capital items from the 2019/20 surplus, with the exception of the Keshen Goodman Library renovation to be funded from Strategic Capital Reserve Q606, as follows:

- Pave Oak Ridge Drive \$36,400
- Downtown Dartmouth Infrastructure Renewal \$2,000,000
- Design Work Regatta Point Seawall \$80,000
- Recreation Facility in Musquodoboit Harbour Valley/Splash Pad CP 180001 \$250,000
- Construction of Splash Pads \$500,000
- African NS Affairs Integration Office/Halifax Partnership Economic Strategy \$50,000
- Rural Transit Grant Musgo Rider \$200,000 (Capital)

MOTION TO AMEND PUT AND PASSED UNANIMOUSLY.

The motion before Council now reads:

MOVED by Councillor Nicoll, seconded by Councillor Whitman

THAT the Budget Committee direct the Chief Administrative Officer to finalize a Proposed Budget for Halifax Regional Council approval including funding for the following:

1. Graves Oakley Park Change Room/Washroom in the amount of \$315,000 with funding coming from Contingency Reserve Q421,

2. Bus Stop Theatre Grant in the amount of \$125,000 in 2020/21 with funding coming from Contingency Reserve Q421,

3. Economic Development Strategy with Halifax Partnership in the amount of \$135,000 to be funded from Fiscal Services,

4. Provision of Menstrual Products in municipally owned community centers and partner facilities to be funded within the existing Corporate and Customer Services 2020/21 operational budget, and

5. Include any accepted items from the Budget Adjustment List to be added/removed to/from the 2020/21 Proposed Budget.

6. Fund one time operating and capital items from the 2019/20 surplus, with the exception of the Keshen Goodman Library renovation to be funded from Strategic Capital Reserve Q606, as follows:

- Pave Oak Ridge Drive \$36,400
- Downtown Dartmouth Infrastructure Renewal \$2,000,000
- Design Work Regatta Point Seawall \$80,000
- Recreation Facility in Musquodoboit Harbour Valley/Splash Pad CP 180001 \$250,000
- Construction of Splash Pads \$500,000
- African NS Affairs Integration Office/Halifax Partnership Economic Strategy \$50,000
- Rural Transit Grant Musgo Rider \$200,000 (Capital)

Budget Committee considered each operating over and under budget item as follows:

Proposed Legislative Assistant (new position) for Clerk's Office - Legal, Municipal Clerk & External Affairs

MOVED by Councillor Mason, seconded by Councillor Whitman

THAT the Budget Committee direct staff to prepare the 2020/2021 budget with the addition of \$67,200 for the proposed Legislative Assistant (new position) for the Clerk's Office.

MOTION PUT AND PASSED UNANIMOUSLY.

Not present: Councillor Zurawski

Unfunded Legal Position (new position) - Legal, Municipal Clerk & External Affairs

MOVED by Councillor Whitman, seconded by Councillor Mason

THAT the Budget Committee direct staff to prepare the 2020/2021 budget with the addition of \$122,600 for the unfunded legal position (new position) for Legal Services.

MOTION PUT AND PASSED. (11 in favour, 6 against)

In favour: Deputy Mayor Blackburn, Councillors Streatch, Hendsbee, Karsten, Mancini, Mason, Smith, Walker, Adams, Zurawski and Outhit

Against: Mayor Savage, Councillors Nicoll, Austin, Cleary, Whitman and Russell

Unfunded Support Staff (2 new positions) - Legal, Municipal Clerk & External Affairs

MOVED by Councillor Whitman, seconded by Deputy Mayor Blackburn

THAT the Budget Committee direct staff to prepare the 2020/2021 budget with the addition of \$113,900 for the unfunded support staff (2 new positions) for Legal Services.

MOTION PUT AND PASSED. (15 in favour, 1 against)

In favour: Mayor Savage, Deputy Mayor Blackburn, Councillors Streatch, Hendsbee, Karsten, Nicoll, Austin, Mancini, Smith, Cleary, Walker, Adams, Zurawski, Russell and Outhit

Against: Councillor Whitman

Not present: Councillor Mason

Proposed 3-year Navigator Program

MOVED by Councillor Adams, seconded by Councillor Whitman

THAT the Budget Committee direct staff to prepare the 2020/2021 budget with the addition of \$60,000 for the proposed 3-year Navigator Program.

MOTION PUT AND PASSED UNANIMOSLY.

Not present: Councillor Mason

ICT Partnership with VOLTA - Finance, Asset Management & ICT

MOVED by Councillor Nicoll, seconded by Deputy Mayor Blackburn

THAT the Budget Committee direct staff to prepare the 2020/2021 budget with the addition of \$125,000 for ICT partnership with VOLTA.

MOTION PUT AND PASSED. (14 in favour, 2 against)

In favour: Mayor Savage, Deputy Mayor Blackburn, Councillors Streatch, Hendsbee, Karsten, Nicoll, Austin, Mancini, Cleary, Walker, Adams, Zurawski, Whitman and Outhit

Against: Councillors Smith and Russell

Not present: Councillor Mason

ICT - Microsoft Licenses (additional) - Finance, Asset Management & ICT

MOVED by Councillor Nicoll, seconded by Councillor Whitman

THAT the Budget Committee direct staff to prepare the 2020/2021 budget with the addition of \$120,000 for ICT to purchase additional Microsoft Licenses.

MOTION PUT AND PASSED. (16 in favour, 1 against)

In favour: Mayor Savage, Deputy Mayor Blackburn, Councillors Streatch, Hendsbee, Karsten, Nicoll, Austin, Mancini, Mason, Smith, Cleary, Walker, Adams, Zurawski, Russell and Outhit

Against: Councillor Whitman

ICT –Microsoft Licenses (renew corporate wide) – Finance, Asset Management & ICT

MOVED by Councillor Nicoll, seconded by Councillor Whitman

THAT the Budget Committee direct staff to prepare the 2020/2021 budget with the addition of \$400,000 for ICT to renew Microsoft Licenses corporate wide.

MOTION PUT AND PASSED. (16 in favour, 1 against)

In favour: Mayor Savage, Deputy Mayor Blackburn, Councillors Streatch, Hendsbee, Karsten, Nicoll, Austin, Mancini, Mason, Smith, Cleary, Walker, Adams, Zurawski, Russell and Outhit

Against: Councillor Whitman

Corporate Planning - Citizen Survey - Finance, Asset Management & ICT

MOVED by Councillor Nicoll, seconded by Mayor Savage

THAT the Budget Committee direct staff to prepare the 2020/2021 budget with the addition of \$75,000 for Corporate Planning Citizen Survey.

MOTION PUT AND PASSED. (16 in favour, 1 against)

In favour: Mayor Savage, Councillors Streatch, Hendsbee, Karsten, Nicoll, Austin, Mancini, Mason, Smith, Cleary, Walker, Adams, Zurawski, Whitman, Russell and Outhit

Against: Deputy Mayor Blackburn

Reduce Corporate Communications Budget- Corporate and Customer Services

MOVED by Councillor Whitman, seconded by Councillor Cleary

THAT the Budget Committee direct staff to prepare the 2020/2021 budget with a reduction of \$267,600 to Corporate Communications Budget.

Jacques Dubé, Chief Administrative Officer spoke to Corporate Communications' service model, noting that the number of staffing positions had remained unchanged since 2016 but that service demands had increased. Dubé also explained that the creation of three (3) new Full Time Employees (FTEs) would not create a budget pressure and would meet the growing service demands.

MOTION PUT AND DEFEATED. (2 in favour, 15 against)

In favour: Councillors Cleary and Whitman

Against: Mayor Savage, Deputy Mayor Blackburn, Councillors Streatch, Hendsbee, Karsten, Nicoll, Austin, Mancini, Mason, Smith, Walker, Adams, Zurawski, Russell and Outhit

Years 2 and 3 of the Moving Forward Together Plan (MFTP)

MOVED by Mayor Savage, seconded by Councillor Adams

THAT the Budget Committee direct staff to prepare the 2020/2021 budget to include funding for the completion of the Moving Forward Together Plan within the three-year capital plan (\$11,770,000 years 2 and 3 of the current plan).

MOTION PUT AND PASSED UNANIMOUSLY.

Not present: Councillors Mason, Whitman and Russell

Program Funding to Reduce Community Isolation – Halifax Public Libraries

MOVED by Mayor Savage, seconded by Councillor Nicoll

THAT the Budget Committee direct staff to prepare the 2020/2021 budget with the addition of \$50,000 for Halifax Public Libraries program funding directed at reducing isolation within the community.

MOTION PUT AND PASSED UNANIMOSULY.

Not present: Councillors Mason, Whitman and Russell

Rural Transit Grant to Musgo Rider (\$100,000 Operational) - Halifax Transit

MOVED by Councillor Hendsbee, seconded by Councillor Streatch

THAT the Budget Committee direct staff to prepare the 2020/2021 budget with the addition of \$100,000 from operating for the Rural Transit Grant to Musgo Rider.

MOTION PUT AND PASSED UNANIMOUSLY.

Not present: Mayor Savage, Councillors Mason, Whitman and Russell

Grants to Business Improvement Districts (BIDs) - Legal, Municipal Clerk & External Affairs

MOVED by Councillor Mancini, seconded by Councillor Mason

THAT the Budget Committee direct staff to prepare the 2020/2021 budget with the addition of \$50,000 for grants to Business Improvement Districts (BIDs).

MOTION PUT AND PASSED UNANIMOUSLY.

Not present: Mayor Savage, Councillors Karsten, Mason, Whitman and Russell

Tree Planting/Pruning – Transportation and Public Works

MOVED by Councillor Karsten, seconded by Councillor Nicoll

THAT the Budget Committee direct staff to prepare the 2020/2021 budget with the addition of \$200,000 for tree planting/pruning.

MOTION PUT AND PASSED. (10 in favour, 1 against)

In favour: Deputy Mayor Blackburn, Councillors Hendsbee, Karsten, Nicoll, Austin, Mancini, Smith, Adams, Zurawski and Outhit

Against: Councillor Cleary

Not present: Mayor Savage, Councillors Streatch, Mason, Walker, Whitman and Russell

Parking Ban Enforcement Contract – Transportation and Public Works

MOVED by Councillor Mancini, seconded by Councillor Nicoll

THAT the Budget Committee direct staff to prepare the 2020/2021 budget with the addition of \$34,000 for the parking ban enforcement contract.

MOTION PUT AND PASSED UNANIMOUSLY.

Not present: Mayor Savage, Councillors Hendsbee, Mason, Smith, Whitman and Russell

Budget Committee agreed to vote on the following one-time funding options in one motion:

MOVED by Councillor Zurawski, seconded by Councillor Cleary

THAT the Budget Committee direct staff to prepare the 2020/2021 budget with the addition of:

- Increase to parking fines from \$25 to \$35 (\$175,000);
- Increase trail maintenance (4 staff seasonal) \$79,000;
- Improve Field Maintenance Program (4 staff seasonal) \$79,000;
- Parks and Recreation Inclusion Program (staff, expand program) \$125,600;
- Aquatics Instructors Salary Adjustment \$50,000;
- Art Grants Report \$125,000;
- Increase Parks and Recreation Operational Support to Multi-District Facilities (MDFs) -\$90,000;
- Food Action Plan Initiatives \$100,000;
- Heritage Incentives \$150,000;
- HalifACT2050 3 staff hired by September 2020 (50% \$91,000) \$137,000;
- Heritage Research Program Planner 1 \$80,000;
- Fire and Emergency Increase Requirements for Training Materials and Services to Maintain Standard \$290,000;
- Fire and Emergency Increase Uniforms and Clothing \$270,000;
- Fire and Emergency Increase to Resolve Logistical Cost Pressures \$230,000; and
- Fire and Emergency Increase to Resolve Cost Pressures in Professional Services \$60,000.

MOTION PUT AND PASSED UNANIMOSULY.

Not present: Councillor Russell

Keep Lighting Fee for Outdoor Facilities - Parks and Recreation

MOVED by Councillor Cleary, seconded by Mayor Savage

THAT the Budget Committee direct staff to prepare the 2020/2021 budget to keep lighting fee for outdoor facilities in the Parks and Recreation budget (\$100,000).

Budget Committee discussed whether to keep the lighting fee for outdoor facilities in the Parks and Recreation budget with staff responding to questions.

MOTION PUT AND DEFEATED. (3 in favour, 13 against)

In favour: Mayor Savage, Councillors Zurawski and Whitman

Against: Deputy Mayor Blackburn, Councillors Streatch, Hendsbee, Karsten, Nicoll, Austin, Mancini, Mason, Smith, Cleary, Walker, Adams and Outhit

Not present: Councillor Russell

Right of Way Mowing Reduction - Parks and Recreation

MOVED by Councillor Cleary, seconded by Councillor Nicoll

THAT the Budget Committee direct staff to prepare the 2020/2021 budget with a reduction to the right of way mowing in the Parks and Recreation budget (\$50,000).

Members sought additional clarification regarding areas under review for Right of Way mowing.

MOTION PUT AND DEFEATED. (5 in favour, 12 against)

In favour: Mayor Savage, Councillors Cleary, Adams, Zurawski and Russell

Against: Deputy Mayor Blackburn, Councillors Streatch, Hendsbee, Karsten, Nicoll, Austin, Mancini, Mason, Smith, Walker, Whitman and Outhit

Later in the meeting it was MOVED by Councillor Nicoll, seconded by Councillor Austin

THAT the Budget Committee request a supplementary staff report regarding areas under review for Right of Way mowing in the 2020/2021 Parks and Recreation Budget.

MOTION PUT AND PASSED UNANIMOUSLY.

Not present: Councillors Karsten and Whitman

Accessible Taxis (2 year) - Planning and Development

MOVED by Councillor Austin, seconded by Councillor Cleary

THAT the Budget Committee direct staff to prepare the 2020/2021 budget with the addition of \$200,000 for accessible taxis (2 years).

Discussion was held on the potential legislative changes for accessible taxis that could be made in the Fall 2020 and having contingency funding in place.

MOVED by Mayor Savage, seconded by Councillor Cleary

THAT the motion be amended to allocate \$100,000 for accessible taxis.

MOTION TO AMEND PUT AND PASSED UNANIMOUSLY.

The motion before Council now reads:

MOVED by Councillor Austin, seconded by Councillor Cleary

THAT the Budget Committee direct staff to prepare the 2020/2021 budget with the addition of \$100,000 for accessible taxis (2 years).

MOTION AS AMENDED PUT AND PASSED. (16 in favour, 1 against)

In favour: Mayor Savage, Deputy Mayor Blackburn, Councillors Streatch, Hendsbee, Karsten, Nicoll, Austin, Mancini, Mason, Smith, Cleary, Walker, Adams, Zurawski, Whitman and Outhit

Against: Councillor Russell

Police Operating Under Budget – Halifax Regional Police

MOVED by Councillor Mancini, seconded by Mayor Savage

THAT the Budget Committee direct staff to prepare the 2020/2021 budget with the addition of \$157,500 as an operating under budget option.

MOTION PUT AND PASSED. (16 in favour, 1 against)

In favour: Mayor Savage, Deputy Mayor Blackburn, Councillors Streatch, Hendsbee, Karsten, Nicoll, Austin, Mancini, Mason, Smith, Walker, Adams, Zurawski, Whitman Russell and Outhit

Against: Councillor Cleary

Library Collection Holdings – Halifax Public Libraries

MOVED by Councillor Austin, seconded by Councillor Mancini

THAT the Budget Committee direct staff to prepare the 2020/2021 budget with the addition of \$250,000 for Halifax Public Libraries' collection holdings.

Budget Committee discussed the \$500,000 investment needed to bring Halifax Public Libraries' holdings per capital to the MBNCanada Median. Staff responded to questions on the publishers' pricing structure and growing demand for materials including ebooks and eAudiobook loans.

MOTION PUT AND PASSED. (12 in favour, 4 against)

In favour: Deputy Mayor Blackburn, Councillors Streatch, Hendsbee, Nicoll, Austin, Mancini, Mason, Smith, Cleary, Zurawski, Russell and Outhit

Against: Mayor Savage, Councillors Karsten, Walker and Adams

Not present: Councillor Whitman

Traffic Calming Measure for School Zones – Transportation and Public Works

MOVED by Councillor Nicoll, seconded by Councillor Cleary

THAT the Budget Committee direct staff to prepare the 2020/2021 budget with the addition of \$150,000 to implement traffic calming measures for school zones.

MOTION PUT AND PASSED. (13 in favour, 3 against)

In favour: Mayor Savage, Deputy Mayor Blackburn, Councillors Streatch, Hendsbee, Nicoll, Austin, Mancini, Mason, Smith, Cleary, Adams, Zurawski and Outhit

Against: Councillors Karsten, Walker and Russell

Not present: Councillor Whitman

MOVED by Councillor Austin, seconded by Mayor Savage

THAT the Budget Committee direct the Chief Administrative Officer to apply the 2019/2020 surplus up to \$12.9 million for Capital debt reduction in 2020/2021.

MOTION PUT AND PASSED UNANIMOUSLY.

Not present: Councillors Karsten and Whitman

Budget Committee voted on the main motion, as amended, as follows:

MOVED by Councillor Nicoll, seconded by Councillor Whitman

THAT the Budget Committee direct the Chief Administrative Officer to finalize a Proposed Budget for Regional Council approval including funding for the following:

1. Graves Oakley Park Change Room / Washroom in the amount of \$315,000 with funding coming from Contingency Reserve Q421,

2. Bus Stop Theatre Grant in the amount of \$125,000 in 2020/21 with funding coming from Contingency Reserve Q421,

3. Economic Development Strategy with Halifax Partnership in the amount of \$135,000 to be funded from Fiscal Services,

4. Provision of Menstrual Products in municipally owned community centers and partner facilities to be funded within the existing Corporate and Customer Services 2020/21 operational budget,
5. Include the following items from the Budget Adjustment List to be added to the 2020/21 Proposed Budget as follows:

- Legislative Assistant for Clerk's Office (new positon) \$67,200
- Legal Position for Legal Services (new position) \$122,600
- Support Staff for Legal Services (2 new potions) \$113,900
- Proposed 3-Year Navigator Program \$125,000
- ICT Microsoft Licenses (additional) \$120,000
- ICT Microsoft Licenses (renew corporate wide) \$400,000
- Corporate Planning Citizen Survey \$75,000
- Years 2 and 3 of the Moving Forward Together Plan \$11,770,000 years 2 and 3 of the current plan
- Halifax Public Libraries Program Funding to Reduce Community Isolation \$50,000
- Rural Transit Grant to Musgo Rider \$100,000 (Operational)
- Grants to Business Improvement Districts (BIDs) \$50,000
- Tree Planting/Pruning \$200,000
- Parking Ban Enforcement Contract \$34,000
- Parking Fines (Increase from \$25 to \$35) (\$175,000)
- Increase Trail Maintenance (4 staff seasonal) \$79,000
- Improve Field Maintenance Program (4 staff seasonal) \$79,000
- Parks and Recreation Inclusion Program (staff, expand program) \$125,600
- Aquatics Instructors Salary Adjustment \$50,000
- Art Grants Report \$125,000
- Increase Parks and Recreation Operational Support to Multi-District Facilities (MDFs) \$90,000

- Food Action Plan Initiatives \$100,000
- Heritage Incentives \$150,000
- HalifACT2050 3 staff hired by September 2020 (50% \$91,000) \$137,000
- Heritage Research Program Planner 1 \$80,000
- Fire & Emergency Increase Requirements for Training Materials and Services to Maintain Standard \$290,000
- Fire & Emergency Increase Uniforms and Clothing \$270,000
- Fire & Emergency Increase to Resolve Logistical Cost Pressures \$230,000
- Fire & Emergency Increase to Resolve Cost Pressures in Professional Services \$60,000
- Accessible Taxi (2 years) \$100,000
- Halifax Regional Police Operating Under Budget Option \$157,500
- Library Collection Holdings \$250,000
- Traffic Calming Measures for School Zones \$150,000 and;

6. Fund one-time operating and capital items as outlined in the Budget Adjustment List from the 2019/20 surplus, with the exception of the Keshen Goodman Library renovation to be funded from Strategic Capital Reserve Q606 - \$2,000,000, as follows:

- Pave Oak Ridge Drive \$36,400
- Downtown Dartmouth Infrastructure Renewal \$2,000,000
- Design Work Regatta Point Seawall \$80,000
- Recreation Facility in Musquodoboit Harbour Valley/Splash Pad CP 180001 \$250,000
- Construction of Splash Pads \$500,000
- African NS Affairs Integration Office/Halifax Partnership Economic Strategy \$50,000
- Rural Transit Grant Musgo Rider \$200,000 (Capital)

MOTION PUT AND PASSED UNANIMOUSLY.

Not present: Councillors Karsten and Whitman

5. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned at 3:17 p.m.

Sherryll Murphy A/Municipal Clerk