



**BUDGET COMMITTEE
(STANDING COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE ON BUDGET)
MINUTES
March 29, 2023**

PRESENT: Councillor Paul Russell, Chair
 Mayor Mike Savage
 Deputy Mayor Sam Austin
 Councillors: Cathy Deagle Gammon
 David Hendsbee
 Becky Kent
 Trish Purdy
 Tony Mancini
 Waye Mason
 Lindell Smith
 Shawn Cleary
 Kathryn Morse
 Patty Cuttell
 Iona Stoddard
 Pam Lovelace
 Lisa Blackburn
 Tim Outhit

STAFF: Cathie O'Toole, Chief Administrative Officer
 Jerry Blackwood, Executive Director of Finance & Asset Management/Chief
 Financial Officer
 John Traves, K.C., CD, Executive Director of Legal & Legislative Services
 /Municipal Solicitor/Chief Governance Officer
 Iain MacLean, Municipal Clerk
 Annie Sherry, Legislative Assistant

The following does not represent a verbatim record of the proceedings of this meeting.

*The agenda, reports, supporting documents, information items circulated, and video (if available) are
online at halifax.ca.*

The meeting was called to order at 9:31 a.m. and recessed at 12:08 p.m. Budget Committee reconvened at 1:00 p.m. and recessed at 3:34 p.m. Budget Committee reconvened in at 3:48 p.m. and adjourned at 4:44 p.m.

1. CALL TO ORDER AND LAND ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

The Chair called the meeting to order at 9:31 a.m. and acknowledged that the meeting took place in the traditional and ancestral territory of the Mi'kmaq people, and that we are all treaty people.

2. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES – February 14 & 15, February 17 & 22, and March 3, 2023

MOVED by Councillor Smith, seconded by Councillor Stoddard

THAT the minutes of February 14 & 15, February 17 & 22, and March 3, 2023, be approved as circulated.

MOTION PUT AND PASSED.

3. APPROVAL OF THE ORDER OF BUSINESS AND APPROVAL OF ADDITIONS AND DELETIONS

Additions: None

Deletions: None

MOVED by Councillor Deagle Gammon, seconded by Councillor Cleary

THAT the agenda be approved as presented.

MOTION PUT AND PASSED.

Not present: Deputy Mayor Austin, Councillors Hendsbee, Purdy, Cuttell

4. CALL FOR DECLARATION OF CONFLICT OF INTERESTS – NONE

5. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

The Chair reviewed the rules of procedure for public participation and called for anyone wishing to speak on the matter.

Sarah Archibald, Prospect, spoke on behalf of the Kelly Point Lot Owners Association and encouraged Budget Committee not to implement the proposed 5% administrative fee onto private road area rates for Home Owners Associations. Archibald highlighted concerns with the proposed increase resulting in unpaid fees and a negative impact on the state of the road, being double-charged for services, and issues with the way area rates were created. Archibald responded to questions of clarification from Budget Committee.

Jerry Blackwood, Executive Director of Finance & Asset Management/Chief Financial Officer responded to questions of clarification from Budget Committee.

Kortney Dunsby, Sustainable Cities Coordinator for Ecology Action Centre, spoke to the work of Our HRM Alliance and their support for community action planning for African Nova Scotian communities, increases to professional arts grants, new sidewalks, active transportation infrastructure, funds to support suburban and rural planning, and funds to hire a green network coordinator in budget 2023/24. Dunsby highlighted the importance of community participation in building suburban and rural plans, community

benefits from adequately resourcing the implementation of the Green Network Plan, and concerns with delayed implementation of the Green Network Plan.

Dolly Williams, East Preston, spoke to their role as the Co-Chair of the Road to Economic Prosperity in support of the addition of more planning positions in budget 2023/24, particularly for the work of community action planning with the African Nova Scotian community, and asked that planners to be active in appreciating community visions while prioritizing equity and justice within the planning process. Williams noted that community action planning in Beechville was a model not only for Halifax Regional Municipality, but for the entire country.

Veronica Marsman, Property Manager for AKOMA, spoke to their support of the addition of more planning positions in budget 2023/24, particularly for the work of community action planning with the African Nova Scotian community, the importance of staff working with community to strategize and reduce systematic barriers, and of community being reflected in and part of the development process.

Barry Dalrymple, Fall River spoke in support of allocating funding to McDonald Park Ball Field Lighting in budget 2023/24, concerns with incorrect information within the field strategy report, the impact on minor baseball programming, and the importance of community consultations in strategy development. Dalrymple noted concerns with the lease on the land not being renewed by HRM for over two years, asked that the community be involved in consultations moving forward, and responded to questions of clarification from Budget Committee.

6. REPORTS

6.1 2023/24 Budget Adjustment List (BAL) for Consideration

The following was before Budget Committee:

- Staff report dated March 22, 2023
- Correspondence from Karen Robinson, Antje Flachsbarth, Bob Found, Joanna Bull, Kortney Dunsby and Maggy Burns, Karen Lancaster, Matt Stickland, Alex Pfaff, Greg Dickie, Julia Topple, Aaron Beaudoin, Audrey Flanders, Jennie Briggs, Adriana Afford, Bill Hildreth, Marianne Arab, Shonna Brown, Hannah Zamora, Allie Thibault, Shawn Taylor, Cynthia Power, Reagan Brown, Meaghan MacLellan, Kate Pepler, Tammy Power, Jennifer Carter, Troy Power, Erika Dowell, Bria MacDonald, Samantha Shaw, Jody Rice Gallagher, Travis Smith, Robyn MacKinnon, Denise Soper, Luigi Costanzo, Rosemary Clarke Young, Carol Morrison, Nancy Roberts, Lynn Johnson, Kit Clarke, W.S. Sinclair, Sheila Harnish, Joy Matthews, Tim Rissesco and Paul MacKinnon and Sue Uteck, Sarah Archibald, Tim Richardson, Tracy Jackson, Andrea Arbic, Lindsay Lee, Martha Leary, Robert Rutkowski, Wendy McDonald, Andrew Taylor on behalf of the resident members of the Accessibility Advisory Committee, Commissioner Becky Kent on behalf of the Board of Police Commissioners, Catherine Smalley, Candace Stevenson, Deborah Hall, Dale Smith, Joanne Rowe, Kathleen Hall, Laura White, Matt Charlton, Molly Kohn, Richmond Campbell and Susan Sherwin, Tim Leary, Carolane Fortier, Danielle Louise, Jillian Banfield, Jey Gorman, Kay Stanfield, Martyn Williams, Peter Buzek, Sarah Clark, Stephen Glazier, Katherine Studholme, Tatjana Brauer-Chapin, Aaron Johnstone and Greg Johnstone and Mike Johnstone, Ian Henteleff, Joel Chiasson, Jack Gerard, Justin Smith, Ruth Cunningham, Sara Tapper, Michael MacInnis, Josolyn Cuvelier, Beverlee MacLellan, Curtis Whiley, Ryan Mulloy, and Christian Rankin
- Staff presentation dated March 29, 2023

Cathie O'Toole, Chief Administrative Officer, and Tyler Higgins, Manager, Budget & Reserves gave a presentation and responded to questions of clarification from Budget Committee.

MOVED by Councillor Outhit, seconded by Councillor Lovelace

THAT the Budget Committee:

1. **Direct the Chief Administrative Officer to finalize a Proposed Operating Budget for Regional Council that includes items 1 through 31 from the Budget Adjustment List schedule in Attachment A of the staff report dated March 22, 2023 to be added/removed to/from the 2023/24 Proposed Operating Budget;**
2. **Direct the Chief Administrative Officer to finalize the Capital Budget for Regional Council that includes items 36 and 39 from Budget Adjustment List from schedule in Attachment A of the staff report dated March 22, 2023 to be added to the 2023/24 approved Capital Budget;**
3. **Notwithstanding the February 17, 2023 direction to proceed with a revenue increase of \$1,450,000, direct the Chief Administrative Officer to include a revenue increase of \$1,200,000 through a Building Permit Fee increase to Planning and Developments 2023/24 proposed budget as outlined in the Briefing Note BN031 and recommend that Regional Council rescind the motion from February 17, 2023.**

MOVED by Councillor Outhit, seconded by Councillor Stoddard

THAT the motion be amended to increase the proposed 2023/24 Operating Budget as set out in Recommendation 1 by removing:

- a. **Item 11 in the full amount of \$50,000**
- b. **Item 13 in the full amount of \$20,000**

Ray Walsh, Director, Parks responded to questions of clarification from Budget Committee regarding the scope of the briefing notes and clarified that mowing for cul-de-sacs would not be impacted by item 11 or item 13.

As provided for in section 66 of Administrative Order One, *Respecting the Procedures of the Council*, the motion was withdrawn with consent of Budget Committee.

Jerry Blackwood, Executive Director of Finance & Asset Management/Chief Financial Officer, and Dave Harley, Director, Accounting & Financial Reporting responded to questions of clarification from Budget Committee.

Maggie MacDonald, Executive Director, Parks & Recreation responded to questions of clarification from Budget Committee regarding the details of the easement of McDonald Park.

MOVED by Councillor Deagle Gammon, seconded by Councillor Outhit

THAT the motion be amended to increase the proposed 2023/24 Capital Budget, as set out in Recommendation 2 by adding \$75,000 for the McDonald Sports Park survey (BN075).

Jerry Blackwood, Executive Director of Finance & Asset Management/Chief Financial Officer responded to questions of clarification from Budget Committee and noted that this item would be ineligible for funding from debt.

MOTION TO AMEND PUT AND PASSED. (15 in favour, 2 against)

In favour: Budget Committee Chair Russell, Mayor Savage, Deputy Mayor Austin, Councillors Deagle Gammon, Hendsbee, Kent, Purdy, Mancini, Mason, Smith, Morse, Stoddard, Lovelace, Blackburn, Outhit

Against: Councillors Cleary, Cuttell

Cathie O'Toole, Chief Administrative Officer responded to questions of clarification from Budget Committee.

MOVED by Councillor Cuttell, seconded by Councillor Purdy

THAT the motion be amended to increase the proposed 2023/24 Operating Budget as set out in Recommendation 1 by removing item 3 by the full amount of \$70,000.

Cathie O'Toole, Chief Administrative Officer and Jerry Blackwood, Executive Director of Finance & Asset Management/Chief Financial Officer responded to questions of clarification from Budget Committee.

Renée Towns, Director of Revenue/Treasurer responded to questions of clarification from Budget Committee regarding the budgetary impact of changing the administrative fee for community and private road area rates from 5% to 1%.

Councillor Deagle Gammon proposed to amend the motion by striking, "removing item 3 by the full amount of \$70,000" and replacing it with, "amending item 3 to adjust the administrative fee for community and private road area rates from 5% to 1% (BN007)." As provided for in section 53 (2) of Administrative Order One, *Respecting the Procedures of the Council*, the amendment was accepted as friendly.

The motion now read:

MOVED by Councillor Cuttell, seconded by Councillor Purdy

THAT the motion be amended to increase the proposed 2023/24 Operating Budget as set out in Recommendation 1 by amending item 3 to adjust the administrative fee for community and private road area rates from 5% to 1% (BN007).

Blackwood and Towns responded to questions of clarification from Budget Committee.

MOTION AS AMENDED PUT AND PASSED. (9 in favour, 8 against)

In favour: Mayor Savage, Councillors Deagle Gammon, Hendsbee, Kent, Purdy, Morse, Cuttell, Stoddard, Outhit

Against: Budget Committee Chair Russell, Deputy Mayor Austin, Councillors Mancini, Mason, Smith, Cleary, Lovelace, Blackburn

Shannon Miedema, Director, Environment & Climate Change responded to questions of clarification from Budget Committee regarding staffing positions for HalifACT.

MOVED by Deputy Mayor Austin, seconded by Councillor Morse

THAT the motion be amended to include a new section that reads as follows:

- 4. Increase the proposed 2023/24 Operating Budget by adding the seven positions identified in the HalifACT Resource Plan BN067 by the full amount of \$412,000.**

Cathie O'Toole, Chief Administrative Officer, John MacPherson, Executive Director, Property, Fleet & Environment, and John Traves K.C., CD, Executive Director of Legal & Legislative Services/Municipal Solicitor/Chief Governance Officer responded to questions of clarification from Budget Committee.

Shannon Miedema, Director, Environment & Climate Change responded to questions of clarification from Budget Committee regarding staffing changes in previous budgets and staff capacity to implement HalifACT.

Jerry Blackwood, Executive Director of Finance & Asset Management/Chief Financial Officer responded to questions of clarification from Budget Committee regarding the funding scope of the Climate Action Tax.

MOTION TO AMEND PUT AND PASSED. (9 in favour, 8 against)

In favour: Deputy Mayor Austin, Councillors Mancini, Mason, Smith, Cleary, Morse, Stoddard, Blackburn, Outhit

Against: Budget Committee Chair Russell, Mayor Savage, Councillors Deagle Gammon, Hendsbee, Kent, Purdy, Cuttell, Lovelace

O'Toole and Philip Dugandzic, Director, Corporate Facility Design & Construction responded to questions of clarification from Budget Committee.

MOVED by Councillor Mason, seconded by Councillor Outhit

THAT the motion be amended to increase the proposed 2023/24 Operating Budget as set out in Recommendation 1 by removing item 5 by the full amount of \$538,000.

Victoria Horne, Director, Parking Services responded to questions of clarification from Budget Committee and noted that new parking signage would be required if items 5 and 6 from the Budget Adjustment List were both included in budget 2023/24, which would take away approximately \$40,000 in revenue from year one of implementation. Horne further noted that the inclusion of item 5 or 6 on their own in budget 2023/24 would require stickers rather than new parking signage.

MOTION TO AMEND PUT AND DEFEATED. (8 in favour, 9 against)

In favour: Budget Committee Chair Russell, Mayor Savage, Councillors Purdy, Mancini, Mason, Stoddard, Lovelace, Outhit

Against: Deputy Mayor Austin, Councillors Deagle Gammon, Hendsbee, Kent, Smith, Cleary, Morse, Cuttell, Blackburn

Blackwood and O'Toole responded to questions of clarification from Budget Committee.

MOVED by Mayor Savage, seconded by Councillor Outhit

THAT the motion be amended to increase the proposed 2023/24 Operating Budget as set out in Recommendation 1 by removing item 6 by the full amount of \$213,000.

Cathie O'Toole, Chief Administrative Officer responded to questions of clarification from Budget Committee.

MOTION TO AMEND PUT AND PASSED. (15 in favour, 2 against)

In favour: Budget Committee Chair Russell, Mayor Savage, Deputy Mayor Austin, Councillors Deagle Gammon, Kent, Purdy, Mancini, Mason, Smith, Morse, Cuttell, Stoddard, Lovelace, Blackburn, Outhit

Against: Councillors Hendsbee, Cleary

Rosalyn Smith, Director, Regional Recreation Services and Maggie MacDonald, Executive Director, Parks & Recreation responded to questions of clarification from Budget Committee.

MOVED by Councillor Cleary, seconded by Councillor Mancini

THAT the motion be amended to decrease the proposed 2023/24 Operating Budget as set out in Recommendation 1 by removing item 19 by the full amount of \$746,200.

Cathie O'Toole, Chief Administrative Officer responded to questions of clarification from Budget Committee regarding ongoing efforts to address community safety within the Halifax Regional Municipality, noted that item 19 on the Budget Adjustment List did not pose a conflict to these efforts, and that the budget request was largely a staff resourcing matter driven by population growth in RCMP service areas.

Chief Superintendent Jeffrey Christie, Officer in Charge, Halifax District Royal Canadian Police responded to questions of clarification from Budget Committee regarding full-time-equivalent staffing over the past 10 years and increases to both frequency and staff time spent responding to mental health calls.

Jerry Blackwood, Executive Director of Finance & Asset Management/Chief Financial Officer, and John Traves, K.C., CD, Executive Director of Legal & Legislative Services/Municipal Solicitor/Chief Governance Officer responded to questions of clarification from Budget Committee.

MOTION TO AMEND PUT AND DEFEATED. (3 in favour, 13 against)

In favour: Deputy Mayor Austin, Councillors Mancini, Cleary

Against: Budget Committee Chair Russell, Councillors Deagle Gammon, Hendsbee, Kent, Purdy, Mason, Smith, Morse, Cuttell, Stoddard, Lovelace, Blackburn, Outhit

Not present: Mayor Savage

MOVED by Councillor Purdy, seconded by Councillor Cleary

THAT the motion be amended to decrease the proposed 2023/24 Operating Budget as set out in Recommendation 1 by removing item 21 by the full amount of \$350,000.

Victoria Horne, Director, Parking Services responded to questions of clarification from Budget Committee and noted that item 21 on the Budget Adjustment List would provide an opportunity to establish rigour around outcomes and standards for towing operations if included in budget 2023/24.

MOTION TO AMEND PUT AND DEFEATED. (4 in favour, 12 against)

In favour: Budget Committee Chair Russell, Councillors Purdy, Stoddard, Lovelace

Against: Deputy Mayor Austin, Councillors Deagle Gammon, Hendsbee, Kent, Mancini, Mason, Smith, Cleary, Morse, Cuttell, Blackburn, Outhit

Not present: Mayor Savage

O'Toole responded to questions of clarification from Budget Committee.

Tyler Higgins, Manager, Budget & Reserves responded to questions of clarification from Budget Committee and noted that adjustments from the floor had resulted in a tax rate of 5.8%.

MOVED by Councillor Hendsbee

THAT the motion be amended to decrease the proposed 2023/24 Operating Budget, as set out in Recommendation 1, by adding BN019 - Elimination of Summer Weekly Green Cart Organics

Collection, and amending the recommendation to eliminate weekly green cart collection for the month of July.

As set out in section 65(1) of Administrative Order One, Respecting the Procedures of the Council, all motions shall be seconded before being debated or voted on. As there was no seconder, the motion was lost.

MOVED by Councillor Purdy, seconded by Councillor Kent

THAT the Budget Committee decrease the proposed 2023/24 Public Works Operating Budget by \$900,000 for the 2023/24 Urban Forest Master Plan (UFMP) Tree Planting Project (BN002).

Brad Anguish, Executive Director, Public Works & Chief Engineer responded to questions of clarification from Budget Committee regarding impacts on operations and the net number of trees planted if the motion was approved.

Shannon Miedema, Director, Environment & Climate Change responded to questions of clarification from Budget Committee.

Tyler Higgins, Manager, Budget & Reserves responded to questions of clarification from Budget Committee and noted that Budget Committee reduced this item by \$755,000 at their January 18, 2023, meeting, and the motion would result in an additional reduction of \$900,000 in budget 2023/24 if approved.

MOTION TO AMEND PUT AND DEFEATED. (6 in favour, 10 against)

In favour: Budget Committee Chair Russell, Councillors Deagle Gammon, Hendsbee, Kent, Purdy, Lovelace

Against: Deputy Mayor Austin, Councillors Mancini, Mason, Smith, Cleary, Morse, Cuttell, Stoddard, Blackburn, Outhit

Not present: Mayor Savage

The question was called on the main motion:

MOVED by Councillor Outhit, seconded by Councillor Lovelace

THAT the Budget Committee:

- 1. Direct the Chief Administrative Officer to finalize a Proposed Operating Budget for Regional Council that includes items 1, 2, 3 as amended, 4, 5, and 7 through 31 from the Budget Adjustment List schedule in Attachment A of the staff report dated March 22, 2023 to be added/removed to/from the 2023/24 Proposed Operating Budget;**
- 2. Direct the Chief Administrative Officer to finalize the Capital Budget for Regional Council that includes items 36, 37 as amended, 38, and 39 from Budget Adjustment List from schedule in Attachment A of the staff report dated March 22, 2023 to be added to the 2023/24 approved Capital Budget;**
- 3. Notwithstanding the February 17, 2023 direction to proceed with a revenue increase of 1,450,000, direct the Chief Administrative Officer to include a revenue increase of \$1,200,000 through a Building Permit Fee increase to Planning and Developments 2023/24 proposed budget as outlined in the Briefing Note BN031 and recommend that Regional**

Council rescind the motion from February 17, 2023.

- 4. Increase the proposed 2023/24 Operating Budget by adding the seven positions identified in the HalifACT Resource Plan BN067 by the full amount of \$412,000.**

MOTION AS AMENDED PUT AND PASSED. (15 in favour, 1 against)

In favour: Budget Committee Chair Russell, Deputy Mayor Austin, Councillors Deagle Gammon, Hendsbee, Kent, Mancini, Mason, Smith, Cleary, Morse, Cuttell, Stoddard, Lovelace, Blackburn, Outhit

Against: Councillor Purdy

Not present: Mayor Savage

6.2 Halifax Regional Police (HRP) and Royal Canadian Mounted Police (RCMP) – Deferred from February 3, 2023

The following was before Budget Committee:

- Board of Police Commissioners report dated January 31, 2023
- Extract from the February 3, 2023 Budget Committee minutes

MOVED by Councillor Mancini, seconded by Councillor Lovelace

THAT the Budget Committee direct the Chief Administrative Officer to incorporate the Halifax Regional Police/ Royal Canadian Mounted Police (HRP-RCMP) proposed 2023/24 Budget and Business Plan, as set out and discussed in the accompanying plan and supporting presentation of the report dated January 31, 2023, into the Draft 2023/24 Operating Budget.

Cathie O'Toole, Chief Administrative Officer, Jerry Blackwood, Executive Director of Finance & Asset Management/Chief Financial Officer, and John Traves, K.C., CD, Executive Director of Legal & Legislative Services/Municipal Solicitor/Chief Governance Officer responded to questions of clarification from Budget Committee.

As provided for in section 90 of Administrative Order One, *Respecting the Procedures of the Council*, the motion was separated for voting purposes.

MOVED by Councillor Mancini, seconded by Councillor Lovelace

- 1. THAT the Budget Committee direct the Chief Administrative Officer to incorporate the Halifax Regional Police (HRP) proposed 2023/24 Budget and Business Plan, as set out and discussed in the accompanying plan and supporting presentation of the report dated January 31, 2023, into the Draft 2023/24 Operating Budget.**

MOTION PUT AND PASSED UNANIMOUSLY.

Not present: Mayor Savage

MOVED by Councillor Mancini, seconded by Councillor Lovelace

- 2. That the Budget Committee direct the Chief Administrative Officer to incorporate the Royal Canadian Mounted Police (RCMP) proposed 2023/24 Budget and Business Plan, as set out and discussed in the accompanying plan and supporting presentation of the report dated January 31, 2023, and as amended through the discussion of the Budget Adjustment List into the Draft 2023/24 Operating Budget.**

MOTION PUT AND PASSED. (14 in favour, 2 against)

In favour: Budget Committee Chair Russell, Councillors Deagle Gammon, Hendsbee, Kent, Purdy, Mancini, Mason, Smith, Morse, Cuttell, Stoddard, Lovelace, Blackburn, Outhit

Against: Deputy Mayor Austin, Councillor Cleary

Not present: Mayor Savage

7. IN CAMERA (IN PRIVATE)

7.1 In Camera (In Private) Minutes – February 3, 2023

This matter was dealt with in public as follows:

MOVED by Councillor Hendsbee, seconded by Councillor Kent

THAT the In Camera (In Private) minutes of February 3, 2023, be approved as circulated.

MOTION PUT AND PASSED UNANIMOUSLY.

Not present: Mayor Savage

Private and Confidential Information Items

1. Private and Confidential In Camera (In Private) Information Report - re: Intergovernmental Relations

8. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned at 4:44 p.m.

Iain MacLean
Municipal Clerk