

P.O. Box 1749 Halifax, Nova Scotia B3J 3A5 Canada

Item No. 15.1.3 Halifax Regional Council May 17, 2022

то:	Mayor Savage and Members of Halifax Regional Council
SUBMITTED BY:	Original Signed by Jacques Dubé, Chief Administrative Officer
DATE:	April 29, 2022
SUBJECT:	Increase to Paid Parking Violations

<u>ORIGIN</u>

On March 23, 2022, during the Budget Adjustment List (BAL) deliberations at the Budget Committee, the budget committee approved the parking ticket fee increase to the P-500 Parking Meter By-Law fine amount from \$35 (\$30 if paid in 7 days) to \$45 (\$40 if paid in 7 days).

LEGISLATIVE AUTHORITY

Motor Vehicle Act, section153

By-law P-500, the *Parking Meter By-law*

Summary Proceedings Act and the Summary Offense Ticket Regulations

RECOMMENDATION

It is recommended that Halifax Regional Council adopt By-law P-509, set out as Attachment B to this report.

BACKGROUND

On February 11, 2022, during the budget presentation at the Budget Committee, the Budget Committee requested a briefing note on the proposed parking ticket fee increase to the P-500 Parking Meter By-Law fine amount from \$35 (\$30 if paid in 7 days) to \$45 (\$40 if paid in 7 days).

On March 23, 2022, during the BAL deliberations at the Budget Committee, the Budget Committee approved the parking ticket fee increase to the P-500 Parking Meter By-Law fine amount from \$35 (\$30 if paid in 7 days) to \$45 (\$40 if paid in 7 days).

DISCUSSION

A by-law change is required to facilitate the increase as directed by Committee of the Whole during the budget process.

Hourly rates developed and managed on a supply/demand strategy coupled with good enforcement should result in the right occupancy rate for curb pricing. Staff plan to return to Council later this year with updated data on supply and utilization and recommendations for changes to By-law P-500. Regional Council last made changes to the current paid parking hourly rates in the fall of 2021 and in response to a drop in traffic due to COVID 19.

According to Donald Shoup, world-renowned professor of Urban Planning and author of "The High Cost of Free Parking", cities "cannot successfully manage curb parking without effective enforcement ... Modest fines are sufficient deterrent for most drivers who rarely receive a parking ticket." (p. 687)¹ He suggests instead that graduated fines are the best way to deter chronic violators without unfairly punishing other casual users.

A comprehensive utilization assessment has not been completed since the technology has launched due to COVID-19 and changes in behaviour patterns. However, smaller field studies for specific projects have indicated that demand is reduced and that on average we are achieving our 85% occupancy capacity target. This could be attributed to several factors including the recent increase in ticket fines. Staff has recently awarded a contract to Harbourside Consulting to conduct a supply and demand analysis later this Spring.

By-law P-500 sets out that it is a new and separate offence for each additional hour a vehicle remains parked in any parking space beyond the maximum period allowed. This allows multiple tickets to be issued to the driver on the same day as long as the parking infraction continues. Relying on this approach for enforcement does create resourcing concerns to ensure there is adequate staff to repeat routes and often results in criticism from the public that staff are too punitive or heavy handed. As a result of Council's debate, staff is investigating a tiered ticket system. Staff intend to return to Council later this year with additional information on the considerations of implementing such a program.

Staff has pulled statistics on violations and repeat offenders since the launch of the new parking technology and subsequent ticket fine increase from \$25-\$35 per Council direction during the 2019 budget process:

Since November 1, 2020, **31,680** pay station violations have been issued, **12,683 (or 40%)** were issued to "repeat offenders".

¹ Shoup, D. C. (2017). *The high cost of Free Parking*. Routledge.

Jurisdictional Scan

City	Violation
St. John	\$30
Montreal	\$79
Toronto	\$30-75
Hamilton	\$25
Calgary	\$40-75
Victoria	\$30

The jurisdictional scan suggests that the current rate of \$35 for pay station violations is generally consistent with other locations across the Country; however, an increase to \$45 is not without precedent and has been recommended.

FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

Based on current trends and forecasted ticket volumes over the next fiscal year, staff estimate increasing the fines from \$35-\$45 for paid parking violations would result in \$300,000- \$450,000 in additional annual revenue. Given the requirement to liaise with the Province on implementing a fee change, staff anticipate being ready to implement a rate change from \$35-45 by the beginning of Q3, resulting in an estimated \$225,000-375,000 in revenue for the 2022-23 fiscal year. \$300,000 was approved as an initial estimate in the 2022/23 Operating Budget.

RISK CONSIDERATION

It could take longer than excepted for the Province to approve the new fine amount, resulting in a decrease in revenue for the first fiscal year. Financial impacts could be over/underestimated due to a change in public compliance behaviour in response to the increased fine amount. These risks are rated as low.

COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT

No community engagement was required.

ENVIRONMENTAL IMPLICATIONS

No environmental implications were identified.

ALTERNATIVES

Regional Council may propose amendments other than those currently contained in By-law P-509. This may require a supplementary report back to Regionall Council.

ATTACHMENTS

Appendix A: Showing Proposed Changes to By-law P-500 Appendix B: Amending By-law P-509 A copy of this report can be obtained online at <u>halifax.ca</u> or by contacting the Office of the Municipal Clerk at 902.490.4210.

Report Prepared by: Steven Berkman, Supervisor Parking Administration, Parking Services 902-490-6440

Appendix A (Showing Proposed Changes)

HALIFAX REGIONAL MUNICIPALITY BY-LAW P-500 RESPECTING PARKING METERS AND PAY STATIONS FOR THE REGULATION OF PARKING OF VEHICLES LEFT STANDING IN THE HALIFAX REGIONAL MUNICIPALITY

BE IT ENACTED by the Council of the Halifax Regional Municipality pursuant to Section 153 of the Motor Vehicle Act as follows:

1. Short Title

This By-law shall be known as By-law P-500 and may be cited as the "Parking Meter By-law."

2. Application

The public streets and highways in the Halifax Regional Municipality and parts thereof to which this By-law applies are those upon which, under Council authority, parking meters and pay stations, have from time to time been installed.

2A. Interpretation

In this By-law,

- (a) repealed.
- (b) "commercial motor vehicle" means a commercial motor vehicle as defined in the *Motor Vehicle Act*;
- (c) "electronic payment" means payment by means of a device to the Municipality or to a person contracted with the Municipality to accept payment;

(ca) "mobile application (mobile app)" means a system established by or on behalf of the Municipality, accessible by way of a cell phone or other device, which, when activated by the owner or operator, records the pay parking zone in or the parking meter at which the vehicle is parked, the licence plate of the parked vehicle, and the time required for the use of the parking space;

- (d) "Municipality" means Halifax Regional Municipality;
- (e) "parking meter" means a mechanical or electronic device that indicates a period of time shall be purchased by payment during which parking is permitted in the parking space to which such meter relates;

(f) "parking space" means a space for parking a vehicle controlled and regulated by a parking meter or pay station;

(g) "pay parking zone" means an area of a roadway marked by signs that indicates a period of time to park shall be purchased from a pay station;

- (h) "pay station" means a mechanical or electronic device that indicates a period of time shall be purchased by payment during which parking is permitted in the pay parking zone to which such station relates, excluding a parking meter; and
- (i) "Peace Officer" means a police officer, by-law enforcement officer or a special constable appointed pursuant to the *Police Act.*

3. Placing of Parking Meters and Pay Stations

(1) A parking meter installed in the Municipality shall be placed on the sidewalk and shall designate the parking space associated with it as hereinafter set forth.

(2) A pay station installed in the Municipality shall be placed in the right of way in the pay parking zone associated with it.

4. Parking Spaces

(1) The parking space provided with each parking meter shall be of sufficient size to be accessible and accommodate one standard passenger automobile. The placing of vehicles shall be as follows:

(a) when parking is parallel to the curb or edge of the roadway, the foremost part of the vehicle shall be placed within a space measured along the curb not more than 100 millimeters beyond the parking meter nor more than one meter in measurement to the rear of the parking meter;

(b) when the parking is established at an angle to the edge of the roadway, this shall be appropriately marked or signed, and unless otherwise indicated, a vehicle parked at an angle where parking meters have been installed shall be placed in contact with the curb immediately to the right of the parking meter which applies to the vehicle; and

(c) when two parking meters are supported by one standard, a vehicle shall be parked in the parking space in front of or to the rear of the standard.

(3) Repealed.

(3A) No part of the vehicle shall be parked beyond the standard, and the nearest part of the vehicle to the standard shall be no farther than one meter from it, measured parallel to the curb.

4A. Where a pay parking zone is established by the Traffic Authority and a period of time is purchased at a pay station:

- (a) a vehicle shall be parked parallel to the curb or edge of the roadway; or
- (b) where appropriately marked and signed, a vehicle shall be parked at an angle to the curb or edge of a roadway.

5. Marking of Space

(1) Notwithstanding anything contained in this By-law, special limitations of a parking space may be marked and where so marked, such limitation shall govern the permissible location of a vehicle.

(2) It shall be an offence and a violation of the By-law for any driver to park or leave standing any vehicle beyond such line or marking, except as provided for in subsection 1 of this section.

(3) Not more than one motor vehicle shall be parked in each parking space described in Section 4 and subsection 5(1) above.

5A. Meter Number

A parking meter or pay station shall be identified by a number which shall be known as the meter number.

5B. Pay Parking Zone Number

Every Pay Parking Zone shall be identified by a unique set of alphanumeric characters which shall be known as the Pay Parking Zone number.

6. Large Vehicles

In the case of parallel parking, where the dimensions of a large vehicle are such that the vehicle extends into an adjacent parking space, the vehicle shall be considered to occupy all spaces so affected, and the driver shall be responsible for payment in all applicable parking meters or pay stations.

7. Indication of Time for Parking Meter

(1) Each parking meter installed shall have thereon an appropriate sign or display stating the parking time permitted in the individual parking space to which it relates.

(2) When in operation, each parking meter shall indicate by a receipt, digital display or notification to a remote device the period of time acquired by a payment during which parking is permitted in the parking space to which such parking meter relates.

(3) Upon the expiration of the period of time permitted for parking, the parking meter or remote device shall indicate that parking in such space is in violation of this Bylaw.

(4) Each parking meter shall bear thereon directions indicating the days and hours when payment is required and the period of time that may be purchased for parking.

(5) Each parking meter and remote device shall retain electronically, for at least 24 hours, the license plate number and the amount of time purchased for each transaction during which parking is permitted via electronic payment.

(6) The amount of time retained under subsection (5) of this section, may be accessed remotely or otherwise by a Peace Officer to determine if a vehicle has purchased an amount of time to park at the parking meter or whether the amount of time purchased to park at the parking meter has expired.

8. Repealed.

8A. Indication of Time for Pay Station

- (1) A sign in the pay parking zone shall indicate the hours and days when payment is required to park in the pay parking zone, and the maximum amount of time that a vehicle may be parked in the pay parking zone in a twenty-four hour period.
- (2) The maximum time a vehicle may be parked under subsection (1) of this section shall include the total of any intervals of time that may be purchased.
- (3) Parking is permitted in a pay parking zone when:

(a) the following is entered into the pay station or submitted through electronic payment or mobile app;

(i) the license plate number of the vehicle parked in the pay parking zone,

(ii) the period of time to be purchased, and

(iii) the required fee for the time entered in sub clause (ii) is paid in full; and

(b) the maximum amount of time that a vehicle may be parked in the pay parking zone has not been exceeded.

- (4) Repealed.
- (5) Each operational pay station shall retain electronically, for at least 24 hours, the license plate number and the amount of time purchased for each transaction during which parking is permitted in the pay parking zone.
- (6) The amount of time retained under subsection (5) of this section, may be accessed remotely or otherwise by a Peace Officer to determine if a vehicle has purchased an amount of time to park in the pay parking zone or whether the amount of time purchased to park in the pay parking zone has expired.

9. Payment

(1) When used in directions on a parking meter or pay station the required payment shall refer only to lawful money of Canada.

(2) Council may, by resolution, allow for electronic payment and mobile app for parking.

(3) Where so indicated on the parking meter or pay station, payment shall be made by:

- (a) coin,
- (b) credit card, or
- (c) if subsection 2 applies, by electronic payment and mobile app.

10. Parking Rates

The rate for parking meters and pay stations within the Municipality shall be set by the Council of the Municipality from time to time.

11. Parking in Excess of Time Allowed

(1) It shall be an offence and a violation of this By-law for the driver of a vehicle to park or leave the same standing in any parking space regulated by a parking meter or pay station for a period of time in excess of the maximum period allowed by the direction set forth on such parking meters or pay station regardless of the payment deposited or whether the word "expired" is visible in the observation window of the parking meter or where the meter has a digital display reading "00:00" or the time indicated on the receipt provided under section 8A has expired.

(2) When the driver of any vehicle has parked or left standing in any parking space for a period of time in excess of the maximum period of time allowed by the directions

set forth on such parking meter or pay station it shall be a new and separate offence for each additional hour that an offence continues.

12. Repealed.

12A Commercial

(1) The driver of a commercial motor vehicle, may park or leave such commercial motor vehicle standing in any parking space for the purpose of loading or unloading goods, wares, merchandise, materials or passengers for any period of time not exceeding thirty minutes, without depositing any payment in the parking meter or pay station relating to such parking space.

(2) It shall be an offence and a violation of this By-law for the driver of a commercial motor vehicle:

(a) to park or leave a commercial vehicle standing in any parking space for any period of time in excess of thirty minutes; or

(b) notwithstanding subsection 1 of this section, to fail to comply with the direction set forth on the parking meter or pay station relating to such parking space.

13. Repealed.

13A Repealed.

13B. Unlawful to Park

(1) It shall be an offence and violation of this By-law for the driver of a vehicle to park or leave standing a vehicle in a parking space that is not part of a pay parking zone:

- (a) if a period of time for parking has not been purchased from a parking meter;
- (b) if the parking meter display window related to the parking space indicates that the time purchased has expired by showing the word "Expired" or the digits

"00:00"; or

(c) if the remote device indicates that the time purchased by electronic payment has expired.

(2) It shall be an offence and violation of this By-law for the driver of a vehicle to park or leave standing a vehicle in a pay parking zone:

- (a) if a period of time for parking has not been purchased from a pay station or mobile app;
- (b) if the pay station related to the parking space in the pay parking zone indicates that the time purchased for parking has expired; or
- (c) if the remote device indicates that the time purchased by electronic payment has expired; or
- (d) if the pay station or mobile app indicates that parking is unavailable in the zone.

(3) Unless the vehicle is parked in excess of the maximum time allowed pursuant to Section 11, there is no violation of subsection (1) or (2) of this Section if:

- (a) the vehicle is parked pursuant to the provisions of Section 12A of the By-law; or
- (b) the phrase "Out of Order" is visible in the observation window of the parking meter or pay station relating to the parking space or pay parking zone where the vehicle is parked or left standing.

14. Unlawful to Deposit

It shall be an offence and a violation of this By-law for any person to deposit or cause to be deposited in any parking meter or pay station in the Municipality any device, slug, dice, metallic substance, or other substitute for the payment permitted to be deposited in accordance with this By-law.

15. Parking Administrator to be in Charge of Parking Meters and Pay Stations

The operation, maintenance, regulation and use of all parking meters and pay stations installed in the Municipality shall be under the authority of the Council of the Municipality and under the management, supervision, and direction of the Parking Administrator for the Municipality.

16. Enforcement

This By-law may be enforced by any Peace Officer.

17. Penalty

(1) A person who contravenes any section of this By-law is liable upon summary conviction to a penalty of not less than **thirty-five** forty-five dollars (\$35.00, 45.00) and in default of payment, to imprisonment for a term not less than seven (7) days.

(2) A person who has violated this By-law and is given notice of the violation may pay **thirty-five** forty-five dollars (\$35.00 45.00) for each hour of violation to the

Municipality, however, provided that such payment is made within a period of seven (7) days following the day on which the alleged violation was committed, then the said payment shall be reduced to **thirty** forty dollars (**\$30.00** 40.00) for each hour of violation and, in any case, such payment shall be in full satisfaction, releasing and discharging all penalties and imprisonments incurred by the person for the violation or violations.

17A. Liability of owner and driver

(1) It is an offence to be the registered owner of a vehicle that is parked or left standing in violation of this By-law, whether or not the registered owner is the driver at the time of the violation.

(2) The owner of a motor vehicle shall incur the fine provided for any violation of this By-law unless at the time of such violation the motor vehicle was in the possession of some person other than the owner without the owner's consent, either expressed or implied, and the driver of a motor vehicle not being the owner shall also incur the penalties or other consequences provided for any such violation.

(3) The owner of a motor vehicle who incurs a fine under subsection (2) is not in any event liable to imprisonment.

Exemption from Parking Restrictions

17B. Council has adopted the *On-Street Parking Permits By-law* which exempts certain persons or vehicles from parking restrictions within the Municipality, including parking meters and pay stations, and provides for permits to be issued to those who are exempted.

18. By-law P-200 of the City of Dartmouth, as amended, and the Parking Meter By-law of the City of Halifax, as amended, are repealed.

Mayor

Municipal Clerk

I, Vi Carmichael, Municipal Clerk of the Halifax Regional Municipality, hereby certify that the above noted by-law was passed at a meeting of the Halifax Regional Council held on December 16, 1997.

Vi Carmichael Municipal Clerk

BY-LAW P-500

Notice of Motion:	November 4, 1997
First Reading:	November 18, 1997
Notice of Intent Publication:	November 22, 1997
Second Reading:	December 16, 1997
Third Reading:	December 16, 1997
Approval of Minister of Housing & Municipal Affairs:	N/A
Effective Date:	December 27, 1997
Amendment # 1 (By-law P-501)	
Notice of Motion:	October 21, 2003
First Reading:	October 28, 2003
Notice of Public Hearing Publication:	November 8, 2003
Second Reading:	November 25, 2003
Approval of Service Nova Scotia and Municipal Affairs:	N/A
Effective Date:	November 29, 2003
Amendment # 2 (By-law P-502)	
Notice of Motion:	July 13, 2004
First Reading:	August 17, 2004
Notice of Public Hearing - Publication:	August 21, 2004
Second Reading:	September 7, 2004
Approval of Service Nova Scotia and Municipal Affairs:	N/A
Effective Date:	September 11, 2004
Amendment # 3 (By-law P-503)	
Notice of Motion:	August 2, 2005
First Reading:	August 9, 2005
Notice of Public Hearing - Publication:	August 27, 2005
Second Reading:	September 13, 2005
Approval by Service Nova Scotia and Municipal Relations:	N/A
Effective Date:	September 17, 2005
Amendment # 4 (By-law P-504)	
Notice of Motion:	August 8, 2006
First Reading:	September 5, 2006
Notice of Public Hearing - Publication:	September 16, 2006
Second Reading:	October 3, 2006

Approval by Service Nova Scotia and Municipal Relations: October 1, 2006 Amendment # 5 (By-law P-505)

> August 1, 2017 August 15, 2017 August 19, 2017 September 5, 2017 N/A September 23, 2017

Amendment # 6 (By-law P-506)

Notice of Public Hearing - Publication:

Approval by Service Nova Scotia and Municipal Relations:

Notice of Motion:

Second Reading:

Effective Date:

First Reading:

Notice of Motion:	August 14, 2018
First Reading:	September 11, 2018
Notice of Second Reading Publication:	September 15, 2018
Second Reading:	October 2, 2018
Approval by Service Nova Scotia and Municipal Relations:	N/A
Effective Date:	October 6, 2018

Amendment #7 (By-law P-507)

Notice of Motion:	October 8, 2019
First Reading:	October 22, 2019
Notice of Second Reading Publication:	November 2, 2019
Second Reading:	November 26, 2019
Approval by Minister of Municipal Affairs and Housing:	N/A
Effective Date:	October 13, 2020

Amendment #8 (By-law P-508)	
Notice of Motion:	July 21, 2020
First Reading:	August 18, 2020
Notice of Second Reading Publication:	September 5, 2020
Second Reading:	September 22, 2020
Approval by Minister of Municipal Affairs and Housing:	N/A
Effective Date:	October 13, 2020

N/A Effective Date:

HALIFAX REGIONAL MUNICIPALITY BY-LAW P-509 RESPECTING PARKING METERS FOR THE REGULATION OF PARKING OF VEHICLES LEFT STANDING IN THE HALIFAX REGIONAL MUNICIPALITY

BE IT ENACTED by the Council of the Halifax Regional Municipality pursuant to Section 153 of the *Motor Vehicle Act*, that section 17 of By-law P-500, the *Parking Meter By-law*, is amended as follows:

- (a) striking out the words "thirty-five" and substituting the words "forty-five" after the words "less than" and before the word "dollars" in subsection 1;
- (b) striking out the numbers "35.00" and substituting the numbers "45.00" in the brackets after the word "dollars" and before the words "and in" in subsection 1;
- (c) striking out the words "thirty-five" and substituting the words "forty-five" after the words "may pay" and before the word "dollars" in the second line of subsection 2;
- (d) striking out the numbers "35.00" and substituting the numbers "45.00" in the brackets after the word "dollars" and before the words "for each" in the second line subsection 2;
- (e) striking out the word "thirty" and substituting the word "forty" after the words "reduced to" and before the word "dollars" in fifth line of subsection 2; and
- (f) striking out the numbers "30.00" and substituting the numbers "40.00" in the brackets after the word "dollars" and before the words "for each" in the fifth line of subsection 2.

Done and passed by Council this day of , 2022.

Mayor

Municipal Clerk

I, Iain MacLean, Municipal Clerk of the Halifax Regional Municipality, hereby certify that the above-noted amendments were passed at a meeting of the Halifax Regional Council held on , 2022.

Iain MacLean, Municipal Clerk