

P.O. Box 1749 Halifax, Nova Scotia B3J 3A5 Canada

Item No. 15.2.1 Halifax Regional Council November 28, 2023

TO:	Mayor Savage and Members of Halifax Regional Council	
SUBMITTED BY:	Original Signed	
	David Atchison, Vice Chair, Heritage Advisory Committee	
DATE:	November 15, 2023	
SUBJECT:	HRTG-2023-00871: Substantial Alternation to the municipally registered heritage property at 17 Banook Avenue, Dartmouth	

<u>ORIGIN</u>

November 15, 2023 meeting of Heritage Advisory Committee, Item 4.1.2.

LEGISLATIVE AUTHORITY

Legislative Authority is outlined in the attached staff report dated October 17, 2023.

RECOMMENDATION

The Heritage Advisory Committee recommends that Halifax Regional Council approve the proposed substantial alteration to the municipally registered heritage property at 17 Banook Avenue, Dartmouth as set out in the staff report dated October 17, 2023.

BACKGROUND

Heritage Advisory Committee received a staff recommendation report dated October 17, 2023 to consider the approval of the proposed substantial alteration to the municipally registered heritage property at 17 Banook Avenue, Dartmouth.

For further information refer to the attached staff report dated October 17, 2023.

DISCUSSION

Heritage Advisory Committee considered the staff report dated October 17, 2023 and approved the recommendation to Heritage Advisory Report as outlined in this report.

FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

Financial implications are outlined in the attached staff report dated October 17, 2023.

RISK CONSIDERATION

Risk consideration is outlined in the attached staff report dated October 17, 2023.

COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT

The Heritage Advisory Committee is comprised of seven citizen members and two Councillors. Meetings are live webcast on Halifax.ca. The agenda, reports, video, and minutes of the Committee are posted on Halifax.ca.

For further information on Community Engagement refer to the attached staff report dated October 17, 2023.

ENVIRONMENTAL IMPLICATIONS

Environmental implications are outlined in the staff report dated October 17, 2023.

ALTERNATIVES

Alternatives are outlined in the attached staff report dated October 17, 2023.

ATTACHMENTS

Attachment 1 – Staff recommendation report dated October 17, 2023.

A copy of this report can be obtained online at <u>halifax.ca</u> or by contacting the Office of the Municipal Clerk at 902.490.4210.

Report Prepared by: Dorothy Maponga, Legislative Assistant, Municipal Clerk's Office 902.478.2408



P.O. Box 1749 Halifax, Nova Scotia B3J 3A5 Canada

Item No. 4.1.2 Heritage Advisory Committee November 15, 2023

TO:	Chair and Members of the Heritage Advisory Committee		
SUBMITTED BY:	Original Signed		
	Maggie MacDonald, Acting Chief Administrative Officer		
DATE:	October 17, 2023		
SUBJECT:	HRTG-2023-00871: Substantial Alteration to the municipally registered heritage property at 17 Banook Avenue, Dartmouth		

<u>ORIGIN</u>

An application by WSP, on behalf of Banook Canoe Club (BCC), to substantially alter the municipally registered heritage property located at 17 Banook Avenue, Dartmouth.

LEGISLATIVE AUTHORITY

Heritage Property Act, R.S.N.S. 1989, c. 199

17 (1) Municipal heritage property shall not be substantially altered in exterior or public-building interior appearance or demolished without the approval of the municipality.

By-law H-200, the *Heritage Property By-Law*

- 4. The Committee shall, within the time limits prescribed by Council or the Act, advise the Region respecting:
 - (c) applications to substantially alter the external appearance of or demolish a municipal heritage property.
- 12. Applications for alteration of a registered heritage property shall be evaluated in accordance with the Standards for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada, 2nd Edition as set forth in Schedule 'B-1'. The Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada, 2nd Edition shall be used to interpret and apply the Standards.

RECOMMENDATION

It is recommended that the Heritage Advisory Committee recommend that Regional Council approve the proposed substantial alteration to the municipally registered heritage property at 17 Banook Avenue, Dartmouth as set out in this report.

BACKGROUND

WSP, on behalf of Banook Canoe Club, has applied to substantially alter the registered heritage property at 17 Banook Avenue, Dartmouth (Map 1). The property at 17 Banook Avenue (the 'subject property'), known as Banook Canoe Club, was added to the Registry of Heritage Property for the Halifax Regional Municipality in 1993. The registration recognized the heritage value of the canoe club as an early example of a recreational building. The original portion of the canoe club was designed by local architect H.E. Gates and constructed in 1906.

Existing Site Context

The subject property is located on the south side of Banook Avenue, with Crichton Avenue to the west and Lake Banook to the east (Map 1). The property is 1,546.2 square metres with approximately 80 metres of frontage on Lake Banook. The primary heritage resource on the property is the original portion of the canoe club, constructed in 1906. This portion of the building is located on the northern portion of the property. The surrounding neighbourhood is mostly established residential single-unit dwellings of various ages. Henry Findlay Park is immediately adjacent to the south.

Heritage Value & Character-Defining Elements

To determine the appropriateness of a substantial alteration, a full understanding of the building's heritage value and character defining elements is required. As a point of reference, staff have prepared a heritage building summary which outlines the heritage value and character defining elements for the original canoe club (Attachment A). This summary was created using the historic information contained in HRM's heritage property files and the applicant's heritage impact statement (Attachment B).

The *Standards and Guidelines* are used to perform an analysis of the appropriateness of a substantial alteration's impact on a property's heritage value and character defining elements. The *Standards and Guidelines* help to ensure that careful consideration is given to how the proposed alteration may affect the heritage values and character defining elements of the building. In keeping with the *Standards and Guidelines*, the applicant intends to repair where necessary and rehabilitate previously lost elements with the aid of photographic evidence.

Requested Substantial Alterations

The applicant is proposing to make alterations to the original circa 1906 canoe club for structural and accessibility purposes, and to ensure the continued viability of the building. An overview of the substantial alterations is contained in Attachment C, while a summary is provided below:

- Replacement of the upper and lower-level decking with precast concrete;
- Construction of barrier free decking for accessibility purposes with metal railing in keeping with the original design based on photographic evidence; and,
- Replacement of the existing vinyl windows and doors with wood in keeping with the original design based on photographic evidence.

The above work is proposed as Phase 2 of the project. Phase 1 (under permit #BCOM-2022-12683) involved the demolition and reconstruction of the 'Seniors Room' (circa 1941) and 'Breezeway' (circa 1985) attached to the north and south of the original 1906 building, raising the original portion of the building, and upgrading the existing foundation. Heritage staff permitted this work to be done outside of the substantial alteration process as it did not impact character-defining elements of the property, on the condition that an engineering report be completed to ensure successful movement of the structure. This report was submitted and approved (Attachment D) and work for this phase is underway as of the date of this report.

The applicant's conservation work will be guided by the *Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada – 2^{nd} Edition ('Standards and Guidelines')* and based on historical photographs. Monitoring methods have been identified in the Heritage Impact Statement (Attachment B).

Substantial Alteration Legislation

In accordance with Section 17 of the *Heritage Property Act* (HPA), a substantial alteration to a municipal heritage property requires Regional Council approval. The HPA defines a substantial alteration as "any action that affects or alters the character-defining elements of a property". The character-defining elements of a property are defined as "the materials, forms, location, spatial configurations, uses and cultural associations or meanings that contribute to heritage value and that must be sustained in order to preserve heritage value."

Heritage value is defined as "the aesthetic, historic, scientific, cultural, social or spiritual importance or significance for past, present or future generations and embodied in character-defining materials, forms, locations, spatial configurations, uses and cultural associations or meanings." Therefore, a determination on the appropriateness of a substantial alteration lies in its effect on the property's unique heritage value and character defining elements.

Regulatory Context and Approval Process

If Regional Council refuses the requested substantial alteration to the heritage property, the owners may choose to alter the heritage property three years from the date of the application, but not more than four years after the date of the application, in accordance with Section 18 of the *Heritage Property Act*. Should the substantial alteration plans be revised, a new substantial alteration application will be required, which will start a new three-year waiting period.

DISCUSSION

The overarching term for protecting historic places in Canada is conservation, which is described by the *Standards and Guidelines* as "all actions or processes aimed at safeguarding the character-defining elements of an historic place to retain its heritage value and extend its physical life". Conservation may specifically involve preservation, rehabilitation, restoration, or a combination of these actions. Applying the *Standards and Guidelines* to the development proposal requires an understanding of the approach to the project, and the character defining elements and heritage values for the property.

In this case, a rehabilitation approach is proposed. Rehabilitation involves the sensitive adaptation of an historic place providing a continuing or compatible contemporary use, while protecting heritage value. Rehabilitation can include the replacement of elements or components of the building with an accurate replica or a new design compatible with the style, era, and character of the historic place. Rehabilitation projects can revitalize historical relationships and settings. Rehabilitation projects are evaluated using general Standards 1 through 9, and three additional Standards 10 through 12, which relate specifically to rehabilitation.

Staff have completed an evaluation of the proposal using the *Standards and Guidelines*, and the results are summarized in Attachment G. Regarding this case, conservation involves rehabilitation actions to be completed to the heritage building. Incompatible modifications previously made to the structure will be corrected with elements in-keeping with the historical character of the original building.

Substantial Alterations

The proposed substantial alterations are necessary to ensure continued use of the canoe club. Impacts have been considered and are addressed in the Heritage Impact Statement (Attachment B).

The proposed substantial alterations include:

- Replacement of the vinyl windows and doors with wood in a similar design to the original 1906 building based on historical photographs;
- Replacement in-kind of the painted wood cedar shingles;
- Second storey extension at the northeast corner of the original building; and,
- Replacement of the second-storey decking with metal railing in a similar design to the original 1906 building based on historical photographs.

The early recreational building was designed by local Dartmouth architect H.E. Gates for the Banook Canoe Club in 1906. The proposed interventions will assist in rehabilitating the building to its original design as it will be based on historical documentation (Figure 1). Any modifications to the building materials (i.e., metal railing) are acceptable as it is based on the original design and is being made to meet current building code requirements.

- 4 -

Staff advise that the proposed substantial alteration interventions meet the *Standards and Guidelines* (Attachment G). The vinyl doors and windows are not original and will be replaced with more appropriate material and design based on historical photographs of the original 1906 canoe club. This includes the reinstatement of 8-lite windows on the west elevation and multi-pane windows on the east elevation. The metal doors will be replaced with half-glazed, 12-lite wood doors painted white.

The northeast corner extension at the second storey of the east elevation will involve the removal of a portion of an original exterior wall; however, this intervention allows for the continued historic recreational use and



Figure 1: Banook Canoe Club circa 1909 (Nova Scotia Archives)

functionality as a canoe club. The overhang at the northeast corner was not identified as a characterdefining element of the original structure. Reversing the previous modifications of bumping out the central gambrel and southeast extension may reduce the functionality of the interior. False wood columns along the east elevation second storey will assist in reinstating the symmetry of the original design (see Figure 1). The railing, although to be built of galvanized steel, will reflect the original 1906 design. These interventions will assist in rehabilitating the property to the original design and will be consistent with the historic place, while ensuring the canoe club's historic and continued use.

Overall, the proposed interventions of the original portion of the canoe club will be based on historical photographs and ensure its continued use. It also follows the principle of minimal intervention as identified by the *Standards and Guidelines*. The character-defining elements will not be adversely impacted by the proposed interventions and will be rehabilitated based on historical documentation. Staff advise that the proposed alterations are consistent with Standards 10 through 12 (see Attachment G).

Conclusion

Based on the above evaluation, the proposed alterations to the registered heritage property at 17 Banook Avenue meet the *Standards and Guidelines*. The replacement of the vinyl windows and doors with wood in a similar design to the original 1906 building will be reinstating previously lost character-defining elements. Although the railings will be metal, the new design will be based on historical documentation, and it will be replacing metal railings. The concrete decking will ensure accessibility and the continued use of the structure.

FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

The HRM costs associated with processing HRTG-2023-00871 can be accommodated within the approved 2023/24 operating budget for Cost Centre C340 – Culture, Heritage, and Planning Information Services. HRM is not responsible for construction and renovation costs.

COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT

The community engagement process for a substantial alteration is consistent with the intent of the HRM Community Engagement Strategy. The level of community engagement was information sharing achieved through public access to the required Heritage Advisory Committee meeting.

ALTERNATIVES

- 1. The Heritage Advisory Committee may recommend that Regional Council approve the proposed substantial alteration with conditions and in so doing should provide reasons for the conditions based on applicable conservation standards.
- 2. The Heritage Advisory Committee may recommend that Regional Council refuse the proposed substantial alteration to 17 Banook Avenue. This is not recommended as staff advise that the proposed substantial alteration be approved for reasons outlined in this report.

Note: The *Heritage Property Act* does not include appeal provisions for decisions of Council regarding substantial alterations, however, if the substantial alteration application is refused, section 18(3) of the *Heritage Property Act* provides that the owners would be permitted to proceed with their proposal three years from the date of the application.

ATTACHMENTS

Map 1 Location Map

- Attachment A Heritage Building Summary
- Attachment B Heritage Impact Statement
- Attachment C Design Rationale
- Attachment D Structural Engineer Letter
- Attachment E Site Plan
- Attachment F Elevations & Schedules
- Attachment G Standards & Guidelines Staff Evaluation

A copy of this report can be obtained online at <u>halifax.ca</u> or by contacting the Office of the Municipal Clerk at 902.490.4210.

Report Prepared by: Elizabeth Cushing, Planner II, Heritage, 902.478.2586



Attachment A: Heritage Building Summary



Heritage Value:

The property at 17 Banook Avenue was added to the Registry of Heritage Properties for the Halifax Regional Municipality in 1993. The property's principal heritage asset is the original portion of the recreational club building constructed circa 1906. The building was designed by local Dartmouth architect Herbert Elliot Gates. The tender was awarded to Thomas Merson.

In April of 1903, Banook Canoe Club was incorporated by an Act of Legislature. Arthur C. Pyke was the first president, with Byron Arthur Weston the first secretary. The club is sited strategically on Lake Banook and provides extensive views of the surrounding area. It has been owned by the Banook Canoe Club since its construction.

Attachment B

BANOOK CANOE CLUB

HERITAGE IMPACT STATEMENT

MAY 01, 2023

PREPARED BY C.E. (TED) MITCHELL, MATTHEW BENNETT



wsp



BANOOK CANOE CLUB RENOVATIONS HERITAGE IMPACT STATEMENT

WSP PROJECT NO.: 22F-00008-00 DATE: MAY 01, 2023

WSP.COM

WSP May 2023

Page | 2

1	INTRODUCTION1
2	OBJECTIVES OF THIS REPORT2
3	PROJECT LOCATION2
4	PROJECT GENERAL DESCRIPTION3
5	IDENTIFICATION OF HERITAGE VALUE.5
6	ADJACENT PROPERTIES9
7	PROPOSED WORK10
8	MONITORING METHODS 12
9	PROJECT SCHEDULE & REPORTING
	STRUCTURE
10	SUMMARY13

vsp

1 INTRODUCTION

The Banook Canoe Club (BCC) is a non-profit paddling organization that offers paddling programs, summer and winter programs, swimming lessons, an event rental space, and more to the HRM-community.

BCC has engaged WSP as construction managers for planned renovations to the BCC facility. WSP has in turn compiled a team of design consultants to address issues with the existing facility and develop design upgrades to stabilize the building's structural integrity and upgrade interior spaces to better accommodate the current needs of the BCC programs. Pinto Engineering has been selected to be the prime consultant for this work, along with a team from WSP, Englobe and DesignPoint.

The entire structural foundation system requires stabilization. Phase I of the project will include the modification and upgrading of the existing foundation for Building A and the installation of a new concrete wharf & deck system.

To enable access to the water's edge and allow for the installation the new foundation of Building A, (which is the heritage component of the complex), it will be necessary to demolish the two ancillary structures on either side of Building A. These structures will be replaced upon completion of the substructural work.

This Heritage Impact Statement will address the proposed alterations to Building A and the measures to be taken to retain and enhance the heritage nature of the building. It will examine the design intentions with respect to compliance with the Province of Nova Scotia's Heritage Property Act, and the City of Halifax's adopted Standards and Guidelines for the conservation of heritage properties

Throughout this report, we will make numerous references to Building A and Building B – building A being the heritage classified section of the complex. Please see the inserted figures below.



Figure 1.0 – Building Sections

vsp

Figure 2.0 - Floor Plan



2 OBJECTIVES OF THIS REPORT

The objectives of this report are to:

- Provide a general history of the evolution of the Banook Canoe Club.
- Provide a description of the existing heritage property and outline an understanding of its heritage value and character defining elements.
- Describe the proposed alterations to the building and site and how those alterations meet the objectives of the Municipality and impact the existing site.
- Outline considered alternatives to the proposed design.
- Outline a schedule and reporting structure for the implementation of the proposed heritage strategy and its monitoring.
- Provide a summary statement for this report and its heritage recommendations.

3 PROJECT LOCATION

The Banook Canoe Club is located at 17 Banook Avenue in Dartmouth, NS at the water's edge where Banook Avenue and Boathouse Lane meet. See arial photo below.

While there are numerous heritage buildings in HRM and Dartmouth, none are quite as unique as the Banook Canoe Club. The BCC board recognize this and are determined to not only retain the existing heritage elements but to also enhance the definition of the important elements of Building A.

Throughout years of upgrades, the building has remained in the same spot with similar wharf access throughout the last 120 years.

Figure 3.0 - Aerial View of Banook Canoe Club



The proposed project development application drawings have been previously submitted to HRM, under building permit BPCOM-2022-12683.

4 PROJECT GENERAL DESCRIPTION

A structural investigation has been conducted on the complex and it has been determined that the foundation of Building A has no structural footings which directly relates to numerous foundational issues that currently exist. This is not an uncommon occurrence for buildings of this type, but it will necessitate the removal and replacement of most of the original concrete foundation work.

To accomplish the structural upgrades, the "Senior Room" and Boat Bay directly underneath, as well as the "pass through" structure on the opposite side of Building A, will need be demolished to enable the isolation of Buildings A and B to enable the replacement of the deteriorated and heavily cracked foundation. Sketches indicating the areas to be demolished have been provided at the end of this section.

The work to be undertaken will include:

- Removal of the existing surrounding upper deck, the wharf timber creosote railway ties and wooden decking, concrete slabs, beams, footings, and foundation deck.
- The existing timber wharf will be replaced with precast concrete panels with a cast in place topping, sitting on drilled piles.



- The new upper and lower decking will be constructed with precast concrete and be independent of the building.
- The upper and lower levels will provide smooth barrier free accessible decks which will transition smoothly to the inside of the building.
- In addition, the decking will buttress and support the building. The docks will be floating docks and not part of the permanent structure.

Once the building has been raised and a new foundation put in place, the sections on either side of the original dance hall (Building A) which had to be removed to provide access for the foundation work, will be reconstructed.

Figure 4.0 – Demolition Markups



Level 1 Proposed Demo



Level 2 Proposed Demo

5 IDENTIFICATION OF HERITAGE VALUE

A Brief History of the Banook Canoe Club

In the early 1900s there was no way to easily transport the popular cedar strip canoe from home to Lake Banook to participate in the ever-growing popularity of canoeing.

The recognition of a desire/need to store these beautiful hand-crafted canoes at lake side prompted five young men, who shared a boat shed, to erect a new bigger boathouse and open it for public boat storage of 100 canoes.

Banook Canoe Club was established on April 11, 1903 on the south west end of Lake Banook.

Shares were sold and \$3,000 was raised to build the new boathouse and an upper-level Dance Hall.

The original 1903 building was designed by H.E. Gates with conveniences including dry closets (outhouses) and interior electric lighting. The final cost of construction was close to \$3,000.

Over the next 6 years there were renovations to the building – an addition of 12 feet of docks to the lake side and renovations to the street/front side of the building. The need for additional boat storage for 60 canoes was the driving force to construct a second building on the west side close to the old lock.

The 1909 renovation and addition of indoor washrooms to the upper-level Dance Hall space changed the street side exterior of the building to the current façade. The waterside exterior façade featured an extended roofline over the porch space flanking the gabled roof entrance. By the late 1980s this open porch space had mostly been enclosed to provide additional interior space adjoining the Dance Hall space.

The building has survived the Halifax Explosion, two building fires and numerous storms.

Construction Evolution of the Club

The property was listed as a municipal heritage property on April 27th, 1993. Within those municipal documents there is no mention of any defining heritage characteristics, and no further information has been discovered elsewhere. Since 1993, the current building makeup for the canoe club has only seen minor changes.

Below is a list of key construction dates, whether it was brand new, added or modified. Most of these dates are accurate however, some dates needed to be extrapolated based on photos or book text.

- 1903-1904 Construction of Building A was completed.
- 1920 Building B (Secondary Boathouse) was constructed.
- 1937 Boat bays added beside original dance hall and boat bays.
- 1941 (Estimated based on photos) Seniors Room level is added.
- 1948 Renovations to the beach area completed docks and runways replaced (winter ice damage).
- 1970 The gym (Building B) has extensive fire damage and was upgraded to accommodate an event which changed the aesthetic of Building B the colour scheme was kept but trim work modified.
- 1985 The 'Breezeway' on the upper lakeside patio is built.
- 1998 A fire heavily damaged Building A the boat bays, Senior Room and upper deck all replaced.

vsp



Character-defining Elements

WSP has had thorough discussion with the club, completed research and multiple building reviews, and sought input from municipal archives to determine the five exterior aesthetic heritage defining features below.

vsp

Gambrel Roof Line at the front and back of the building These are the most prominent features of the canoe club, which has existed and been retained since the original construction in early 1900s.	
Gable roof jut outs along with a semi-circle vent A lot of the Dartmouth residential properties that are historic have similar roof styles, on a smaller scale. While the residential soffits tend to be wider, the use of it here warrants heritage value.	
Building 'A' currently has vinyl windows that will be replaced with wood windows. They will be designed to enhance the heritage features of the building and reflect the original look of the building.	



The majority of the identified features have been with the club since inception and that is why we expect these items to be the most critical to maintain. Reconstruction of any portion removed will be reconstructed in its original form.

vsp

6 ADJACENT PROPERTIES

As mentioned in a previous section, The Banook Canoe Club has no similar looking historic properties that are close by. As Figure 3.0 shows below there is another heritage registered building just up the road from the BCC.

Figure 5.0 - Adjacent Heritage Properties



The Oakwood House is a fellow rowing house owned and operated by the North Star Rowing Club. There are some similarities to the two properties. The ages of the buildings are within years of original construction, have similar gable style roof features and window placement. The Oakwood House heritage features are more in line with other residential historical properties in Dartmouth but both of these properties compliment the neighbourhood well.



Figure 5.1 - Oakwood House

7 PROPOSED WORK

The proposed work will include the replacement of the Banook Canoe Club's existing foundation for Building A, along with the replacement of the wharf and deck system. The following is the proposed construction sequence.

If you refer to Appendix 1, you can see what the BCC's current and proposed elevations.

- 1. Demolish/takedown of the Senior's Room, Repair Boat Bay and Passthrough to allow multiple items to happen:
 - Provide access to the waterfront side of the building to:
 - i. Allow machinery to access the critical locations for drilling test pits.
 - ii. Prep Building A to be raised to allow for installation of new supporting structures.

Heritage Impact:

- The raising of the building will provide a uniform floor elevation for the activities area of the second floor of Building A.
- The demolition of the Senior's Room and the Passthrough will provide the opportunity to resize these spaces and accentuate the heritage structure (building A).
- The finish materials and colour of the Building A will be retained and repaired where necessary.
- As can be seen in the proposed elevtions in appendix 1, the re-built senior's room and passthrough will be inset to highlight building A and be clad with unfinished wood siding that will be left to weather and provide a contrast to the Heritage structure.

Alternate Solutions:

- There is no option with respect to the need to replace the supporting structures of the building and no other means to access the areas required to do the work.
- 2. Remove the existing wharf and deck to allow for the foundation work and prep the building to be raised.

Heritage Impact:

• The removal of the deck and wharf are considered part of the exterior look of the BCC. The new deck and wharf will have almost the same footprint and look, but will be of concrete construction rather than wood..

Alternate Solutions:

• Use of a wooden wharf is an alternate solution and a viable option if required. However, the use of concrete will create greater durability, lower maintenance costs, and have a longer life span.

3. Raise Building A by approximately 1.5 feet and complete demolition of existing foundation walls and slabs, then prepping the site for next step. The building will be raised using the new structural beams for supporting the required cribbing, with a screw jack being used to raise. Site preparation includes digging out the existing foundations around the perimeter of Building A and setup of sediment erosion fencing.

Heritage Impact:

- The components of this work and their location will not be visible and therefore will have no impact on the site.
- 4. Form, reinforce, pour and finish new concrete footings, foundation walls and slabs in the Boat Bays (Building A). Supply and install remaining new structural steel columns and beams in the Boat Bays.

Heritage Impact:

- The components of this work and their location will not be visible and therefore will have no impact on the site.
- 5. Lower Building A back into place once reinforced and rebuild the Seniors Room and Passthrough as described in #1 above and illustrated in the proposed elevations in the appendices.

Heritage Impact:

- The reconstruction of the Seniors Room and Passthrough will be completed to retain identical look as before.
- Reuse of the existing windows and doors will take place.
- The red cedar siding currently on those areas has been replaced more recently than Building A's older siding. We will ensure the colour match is identical to the current siding.
- 6. Installation of the new wharf and deck. The majority of this work will be precast panels and flown by crane into place.

Heritage Impact:

• The removal of the deck and wharf are considered part of the exterior look of the BCC. The new deck and wharf will have almost the same footprint and look but will be of concrete construction.

Overall, we feel these upgrades are the best options in terms of renovating the Banook Canoe Club. Future renovations will be under review during this construction period and will form part of a separate construction contract.

Why are these renovations being undertaken?

1.0 Maintenance/Life Safety

As mentioned previously, when the structural investigation was completed, it was determined that, before pursing any future expansions or renovations to the interior of the buildings, the foundation

work had to be in place. The club, over the years, has addressed minor repairs to the foundation walls as temporary fixes which has diminished the capacity to store boats and to utilized the spaces which has resulted in cluttered boat bays and utility rooms. There is significant water penetration through the foundation walls which is creating further degradation of the support system.

The existing wharfs and decks are wooden and are reaching the end of their life expectancy. To keep the construction schedule shortened and cost lowest, it is better to replace as much as possible at the same time. Some of the major work requires that the existing wharf and deck are removed.

Barrier-free access is a current issue at the club, but the new wharf/deck will allow the club to provide access that meets current codes.

2.0 Functionality

The Boat Bays height will be increased by a foot which will make room for more boats and easier access. The Boat Bays capacity is being minimized as a result of the extreme clutter that has been created by the diminished capacity of the structure. The increased height will increase overhead clearance and provide more efficient usability.

The new wharf and deck, while slightly increasing size, will be much more durable than its previous wooden deck. As well, along with the new floating docks will be much more accommodating for the larger war canoes and their rowers.

The club is a frequent host of many national and international competitions and events. Maintaining a space they are proud to host with is important for these events to continue.

3.0 Future Renovations

Without increasing the structural integrity of the building, the potential for future renovations would be limited, and maintenance will continue to rise in costs.

8 MONITORING METHODS

There will be multiple factors in place to ensure the renovations are successful while ensuring heritage is maintained. Here are a few ways WSP will be implementing this:

- 1. WSP will be on-site weekly to review work progress, methods and adherence to heritage plan, along with the General Contractor.
- 2. A heritage-geared site orientation will be created that all contractors, suppliers, visitors must complete and be familiar with.
- 3. Subcontractors who are familiar with heritage projects will be favoured.
- 4. Construction delivery methods will be implemented that will keep the integrity of the property in place.
- 5. WSP will share this report with all stakeholders (owners, contractors, etc).

WSP will ensure any recommendations by this committee will be shared with the owners and implemented into the design and/or construction process where necessary.

9 PROJECT SCHEDULE & REPORTING STRUCTURE

While the project will follow the Municipal procedures for approvals and permitting of the work, we offer the following commentary on proposed heritage scope of work development:

- 1. Existing conditions elevation drawings are attached to this report as record submission.
- 2. Elevation drawings of the demolition stage are also included for reference.
- 3. Submission of construction documents have been submitted to the City and we have received code approval for the work. (Building Permit BPCOM-
- 4. The preparation of a construction schedule and monitoring plan will be prepared outlining the documentation and monitoring of the protection of the retained and conserved historical elements of the building. This will be created by WSP with input from the general contractor.

Attached as Appendix 3 is also a high-level construction schedule to indicate durations of activities listed in the Proposed Work section.

The reporting structure for the project is as follows.

- Owner: Banook Canoe Club Facility Improvement Committee
- Construction Manager: WSP Canada
- General Contractor: Creek Ocean Construction
- Subcontractors: To Be Awarded

10 SUMMARY

In conclusion, we hope this document has included all required information and exhibits the intent of preserving the Banook Canoe Club's heritage value. The work will make the space more enjoyable to all users while also being significantly safer. The Banook Canoe Club Facility Improvement Committee and WSP are excited to be part of rejuvenating one of HRM's most iconic buildings. If you require any further information, please do not hesitate to contact Ted Mitchell for the Matthew Bennett for the mathematical statement.

APPENDIX 1 & 2

EXISTING AND PROPOSED ELEVATIONS



EXISTING EAST ELEVATION



EXISTING WEST ELEVATION



EXISTING NORTH ELEVATION

EXISTING SOUTH ELEVATION

NORTH ELEVATION, POST PHASE 1 DEMOLITION

SOUTH ELEVATION, POST PHASE 1 DEMOLITION



WEST ELEVATION, POST PHASE 1 DEMOLITION



EAST ELEVATION, POST PHASE 1 DEMOLITION







CONSTRUCTION SCHEDULE





Design Rational Letter

Project: Banook Canoe Club, Dartmouth, NS Date: August 24, 2023

Below is an extraction from the original Heritage Impact Statement provided by WSP that highlights the design elements to remain with the Banook Canoe Club. In each element, the rational is provided.

Character-defining Elements

WSP has had thorough discussion with the club, completed research and multiple building reviews, and sought input from municipal archives to determine the five exterior aesthetic heritage defining features below.



۱۱SD

Element: Windows placement, wide frames and white frames Building A currently has vinyl windows that will all be replaced with wood windows, that will be designed to reflect the heritage era of the building. Installation of wood windows will restore a more original look.	KANOOK C
Element: Cedar siding (shake styled) and white trim work around windows, roof lines. This is a large feature of the majority of historic properties in Dartmouth. No change here – reuse of wood siding will retain original look.	
Exterior Veranda/Patio (Lakeside Facing) This feature has evolved but has been maintained since day 1 of the club. The original second floor façade was originally symmetrical on either side of the door; a feature that was changed in a later revision. These upgrades will reinstate the symmetry.	

The majority of the identified features have been with the club since inception and that is why we expect these items to be the most critical to maintain. Reconstruction of any portion removed will be reconstructed in its original form.

Overall, the original look of the building will be fully retained as majority of renovations include a new foundation, deck and interior work. For more information, please review the full heritage impact statement and engineered drawings.



August 23, 2023

Heritage Halifax Regional Municipality

RE: Banook Canoe Club Renovations

To Whom It May Concern,

PINTO Engineering Ltd. (PINTO) completed an existing condition assessment of the Banoook Canoe Club heritage building prior to the renovation design and carried out a structural assessment of the existing building framing. As part of the proposed renovations, the original heritage building will be lifted so that the floor level will match that of the newer adjacent building and all beams and columns supporting the first level floor framing will be replaced with new beams, columns and footings. The structural assessment and subsequent design of new framing was carried out using live, wind and snow loads in accordance with the 2015 edition of the National Building Code of Canada.

The lifting of the building will be carried out by experienced building moving contractors and PINTO will be reviewing all proposed lifting procedures and equipment prior to the lifting of the structure. During the lifting operations, PINTO will be monitoring the work progress to ensure that all necessary temporary bracing and reinforcements are installed so that the stability of the building structure is maintained, prior to installation of the new permanent framing and shear walls and lowering of the building onto the new foundation.

Sincerely, Malcolm Pinto Engineering Limited, per







:\2022\22-322 Banook - Banook Canoe Club\01 - Drawings\Eng Design\22-322_C.dwg, Plot Date: 2023-Jun-19, Plot Size: ISO FULL BLEED A1 (841.00 X 594.00 MM)



P:\2022\22-322 Banook - Banook Canoe Club\01 - Drawings\Eng Design\22-322_C.dwg, Plot Date: 2023-Jun-19, Plot Size: ISO FULL BLEED A1 (841.00 X 594.00 MM)

SURFACE CLASSIFICATION (m2)				
MATERIAL	EXISTING	PROPOSED		
BUILDING	635	659		
ASPHALT	461	450		
CONCRETE	66	165		
GRAVEL	67	30		
LANDSCAPED	150	75		

2 SAE			LAKE BANOO	к
CMB-E CMB-E CMB-E CMB-E CMB-E CMB-E	KEYPLAN 1-6000		PROJECT	
	RETPLAN 1.5000	LE	GEND	~~//
	EXISTING	SURV	EYED PROPERTY BOUNDARY	PROPOSED
		MA. MIN	JOR CONTOUR	
	WA-E	PROPI	ERTY BOUNDARY WATER PIPE	<u> </u>
	SA-E	SA	ANITARY PIPE	— SA — SA — SA — SA — SA — ST — ST — ST
4 	GAS-E ———	NATI		GAS
		SAN		
		ידידיי BOT	TOM OF SLOPE	
	X X	—•— ED	GE OF WATER	x x
		RE	TAINING WALL	
12.49 m			NCRETE CURB	
	CURBSTOP		CATCHBASIN	EXISTING PROPOSED
	PRECAST HEADWA		→ UTILITY POLE w/ GUY WIRE	
5 m 5 m 5 m 5 m 5 m 5 m 5 m 5 m	ELEVATIONS ARE F 57.091 METRES (CG FIELD SURVEYS WE INFRASTRUCTURE 3 5 2023-JUN- 4 2022-DEC 3 2022-DEC 2 2022-NOV 1 2022-SEPT ISSUE DATE DATE 902.832.5597	eferenced to vd2013). RE CARRIED OU ARE APPROXIMA 0 19 14 06 19 -29 CC SIG sring · s	NSHPN 205459, HAVII T ON OCTOBER 23, 2 METRES 3 1:100 REISSUED FOR REVISED AS PER B RE-ISSUED FOR DESCRIPT DNSULTANT NSULTANT NPY of the second U r v e y i n g •	NG AN ELEVATION OF 020. LOCATIONS OF 020. LOCATIONS OF 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0
NS AND HALIFAX REGIONAL MUNICIPALITY MUNICIPAL DESIGN PREPARED JOINTLY BY THE NOVA SCOTIA ROADBUILDERS ASSOCIATION			CLIENT	
IED BY THE NOVA SCOTIA DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENT. RDING CONSTRUCTION SCHEDULING 2 WEEKS PRIOR TO COMMENCING UE TO SILT LADEN RUNOFF FROM THE CONSTRUCTION SITE. CONTROL HANDBOOK FOR CONSTRUCTION SITES" (CURRENT EDITION), ZED WITH 100mm TOPSOIL AND HYDROSEEDED. HYDROSEEDED AREAS /E GROWTH WITHIN THE FIRST GROWING SEASON TO BE RE-STABILIZED. JCTION. WITH ALL PERMIT REQUIREMENTS AND CONDITIONS. ECORD INFORMATION. CONTRACTOR TO CONFIRM LOCATIONS OF		B/ CAN	ANOOK IOE CLL	JB
TOR TO ALLOW A 1 WEEK REVIEW PERIOD BY THE ENGINEER. WER, BELL ALIANT, EASTLINK, AND HALIFAX WATER. CONTRACTOR TO INTRACTOR SHALL ADHERE TO ALL OCCUPATIONAL HEALTH AND		PROJEC	J DESCRIPTION	
(PROPERTY ACCESS, MUNICIPAL SERVICE LOSS, IT ON OCTOBER 23, 2020. CONTRACTOR TO CONTACT DESIGNPOINT FOR INCLUDING GRAVELS, ASPHALT, AND CONCRETE) TO BE REVIEWED AND LIFAX WATER, NOVA SCOTIA DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENT, HALIFAX	BAN DRAIN	NOOK IAGE II dart	CANOE MPROV	CLUB EMENTS
L TEMPORARY TRAFFIC CONTROL MEASURES TO BE IN ACCORDANCE TEMPORARY WORKPLACE TRAFFIC CONTROL MANUAL AND THE LATEST DEVICES FOR CANADA. R AND APPLICABLE APPROVAL AGENCIES, CONTRACTOR RESPONSIBLE		SHEET	DESCRIPTION	
F A CCTV INSPECTION AND REPORT TO THE ENGINEER FOR REVIEW OF IANHOLE VACUUM TEST. PRESSURE TEST TO BE COMPLETED FOR		SERVI	CING PLA	N
R TO TESTING (PUBLIC AND PRIVATE INFRASTRUCTURE). SUBJECT TO APPROVAL BY UTILITY AND ENGINEER). LLATION AT THE MOST DOWNSTREAM LOCATION. INSTALLING ID THE ENGINEER). NHOLE TESTING, INCLUDING CCTV INSPECTION AND DEFLECTION	Drawn S. STACEY Scale 1:100	Engineer G. WOODFOF Filename 22-322_C.dwg	Project No. 22-322	Drawing No. C-02 2 of 2









20012	A DAY OF A DAY	DieL	Diell m	
211				
		OUM.	ETT .	
1				
1 32	A DE LOS			

Craftsman 12-Lite 1-Panel Painted Wood Front Door – DbyD-4225

SKU: DbyD-4225

Category: Craftsman Door Collection

PRODUCT DESCRIPTION

- Craftsman Twelve Lite Custom Door
- 36" x 96" x 1 3/4" door (as shown, any size available)
- Wood Species Shown: Paint Grade (other wood species available)
- Glass Option Shown: Clear Insulated Glass
- · Stain Color: Painted
- Hardware: Kwickset Hawthorne Handleset in the Satin Nickel finish
- This door can be found on a custom home built by Mercer Home in the Hampstead neighborhood in Montgomery, Alabama
- · Glass options include: clear, beveled, leaded, textured
- All glass options can be tempered and dual pane insulated
- All of our wooden doors are made from the finest hardwoods available. No engineered or "core" materials are used in the construction of our doors to ensure optimal performance and unmatched beauty and quality
- We are happy to finish any of our doors with our selections of stains or prime the unit so that it can be painted upon delivery. However, any door unit may also be purchased unfinished. Read our Finishing & Maintenance Instructions
- We offer factory pre-hanging with all of our door units. Doors may also be purchased as a slab if desired
- All of our doors can be sold cut for the hardware of your choice. Visit our selection of hardware
- If you are outside of our local service area, or would like to install your doors yourself, please read our Install Instructions

ATTACHMENT G: Standards & Guidelines Heritage Staff Evaluation: 17 Banook Avenue, Dartmouth

Conservation is the primary aim of the Standards and Guidelines and is defined as 'all actions or processes that are aimed at safeguarding the character-defining elements of an historic place so as to retain its heritage value and extend its physical life. This may involve **Preservation**, **Rehabilitation**, **Restoration**, or a combination of these actions or processes.'

Note: The Standards are structured to inform the type of project or approach being taken.

- <u>Preservation</u> project apply Standards 1 through 9;
- <u>Rehabilitation</u> projects apply Standards 1 through 9, and Standards 10 through 12;
- <u>Restoration</u> projects apply Standards 1 through 9, Standards 10 through 12, and Standards 13 and 14.

Similar to the Standards, the base Guidelines apply to the approach being taken, and additional Guidelines may apply if the project includes rehabilitation and restoration. The Guidelines should be consulted only when the element to be intervened upon has been identified as a character defining element. The Guidelines should not be used in isolation. There may be heritage value in the relationships between cultural landscapes, archaeological sites, buildings, or engineering works. These values should not be compromised when undertaking a project on individual character defining elements of an historic place.

TREATMENT: PRESERVATION

Preservation is the action or process of protecting, maintaining, and/or stabilizing the existing materials, form, and integrity of an historic place, or of an individual component, while protecting the heritage value.

STANDARDS 1-10	Complies	N/A	Discussion
1. Conserve the <i>heritage value</i> of an <i>historic place</i> . Do not remove, replace or substantially alter its intact or repairable <i>character-defining elements</i> . Do not move a part of an historic place if its current location is a character-defining element.	Yes		All character-defining elements of the property will be retained. The interventions proposed will not impact any intact character-defining elements. The applicant intends to replace the previously modified elements (i.e., windows, doors) with design and materials that are based on photographic evidence. No changes to the current location are proposed.
2. Conserve changes to historic places that, over time, have become <i>character-defining elements</i> in their own right.	Yes		The proposed interventions seek to reverse unsuitable modifications that have been made to the structure over time. Previous additions to the building will be rebuilt outside of the substantial alteration process.
3. Conserve <i>heritage value</i> by adopting an approach calling for <i>minimal intervention</i> .	Yes		The original canoe club's character defining elements will be retained and rehabilitated. The replacement of the vinyl windows and doors to wood is a more appropriate material for the structure and the design will be based on documentary evidence. Although the railing will be metal, the design will also be based on documentary evidence. The northeast corner extension at the second storey of the east elevation will involve the removal of a portion of an original exterior wall; however, this intervention allows for the continued

		historic recreational use and functionality as a canoe club.
4. Recognize each <i>historic place</i> as a physical record of its time, place and use. Do not create a false sense of historical development by adding elements from other historic places or other properties, or by combining features of the property that never coexisted.	Yes	The rehabilitation efforts will be based on c.1909 photographs of the structure and will follow the <i>Standards and Guidelines</i> .
5. Find a use for an <i>historic place</i> that requires minimal or no change to its <i>character-defining elements</i> .	Yes	The building will continue to be used for recreational purposes. The metal railing will be designed to meet building code while also reflecting a similar design to the original 1906 structure. The overhang at the northeast corner was not previously identified as a character-defining element, and its removal to be flush with the remainder of the east elevation will ensure its historic and continued use.
6. Protect and, if necessary, stabilize an <i>historic place</i> until any subsequent <i>intervention</i> is undertaken. Protect and preserve archaeological resources in place. Where there is potential for disturbing archaeological resources, take mitigation measures to limit damage and loss of information.	Yes	 Temporary closures will be added during the construction period to protect the canoe club. A structural engineering letter was provided to heritage staff for review prior to work commencement on Phase 1 of the project. Archaeological resources will be addressed at the point of site intervention with permit applications. The provincial government will be notified of the site intervention and process any necessary applications in accordance with the <i>Special Places Protection Act.</i>
7. Evaluate the existing condition of <i>character- defining elements</i> to determine the appropriate <i>intervention</i> needed. Use the gentlest means possible for any intervention. Respect <i>heritage value</i> when undertaking an intervention.	Yes	All character defining elements will be rehabilitated and repaired, if necessary. When a character defining element is sufficiently deteriorated, it will be replaced in-kind, in a manner consistent with the historic place and based on documentary evidence. The gambrel dormer with Palladian window and gable roof do not currently require intervention.
8. Maintain <i>character-defining elements</i> on an ongoing basis. Repair character-defining elements by reinforcing their materials using recognized conservation methods. Replace in kind any extensively deteriorated or missing parts of character-defining elements, where there are surviving <i>prototypes</i> .	Yes	The building will continue to be maintained on a regular basis under the discretion of the Banook Canoe Club Board of Directors.
9. Make any <i>intervention</i> needed to preserve <i>character-defining elements</i> physically and	Yes	All character defining elements will be preserved and rehabilitated. All

TREATMENT: RESTORATION

Rehabilitation is the action or process of making possible a continuing or compatible contemporary use of an historic place, or an individual component, while protecting its heritage value.

STANDARDS 10-12	Complies	N/A	Discussion
10. Repair rather than replace <i>character-defining elements</i> . Where character-defining elements are too severely deteriorated to repair, and where sufficient physical evidence exists, replace them with new elements that match the forms, materials and detailing of sound versions of the same elements. Where there is insufficient physical evidence, make the form, material and detailing of the new elements compatible with the character of the <i>historic place</i> .	Yes		Character defining elements will be repaired, if necessary. Where a character defining element is sufficiently deteriorated, it will be replaced in-kind, matching the form and detailing of the original element. This will be largely informed by photographic evidence. All proposed interventions will be compatible with the character of the historic place.
11. Conserve <i>heritage values</i> and <i>character- defining elements</i> when creating new additions to an <i>historic place</i> or any related new construction. Make new work physically and visually compatible with, subordinate to and distinguishable from the historic place.	Yes		New construction will not displace character defining elements (or architectural features that are consistent with the rehabilitation period). The circa 1941 and 1985 wings, although not considered character-defining elements, that were demolished as part of Phase 1 will be rebuilt and clad in unpainted wood boards to distinguish the additions from the original portion of the building (which will be painted red cedar shingles).
12. Create any new additions or related new construction so that the essential form and integrity of an <i>historic place</i> will not be impaired if the new work is removed in the future.	Yes		The rebuilt 1941 and 1985 wings could be removed in the future without adversely impacting character-defining elements. The extension of the northeast corner could also be reversed; however, it may impact the interior functionality.

TREATMENT: RESTORATION

Restoration is the action or process of accurately revealing, recovering or representing the state of a historic place or of an individual component, as it appeared at a particular period in its history, while protecting its heritage value.

STANDARDS 13-14	Complies	N/A	Discussion
13. Repair rather than replace character-	Yes		All character defining elements will be
defining elements from the restoration period.			rehabilitated and repaired, if necessary.
Where character-defining elements are too			Where character defining elements were
severely deteriorated to repair and where			previously lost, such as the windows,
sufficient physical evidence exists, replace			doors, and railings, sufficient physical and

them with new elements that match the forms, materials and detailing of sound versions of the same elements.		photographic evidence exist. The proposed rehabilitation involves restoring these elements to match the original form and detailing. Revised materials (i.e., metal) have been accepted to meet the functional goals of the canoe club.
14. Replace missing features from the restoration period with new features whose forms, materials and detailing are based on sufficient physical, documentary and/or oral evidence.	Yes	The proposed rehabilitation work on the windows, doors and railings will be based on photographic evidence.