



**HERITAGE ADVISORY COMMITTEE
MINUTES
September 26, 2018**

PRESENT: Iona Stoddard, Chair
Jenny Lugar, Vice-Chair
Councillor Richard Zurawski
Janet Morris
Paul Cole
Derek Bellemore
William Breckenridge
Stephen Smith
Lois Yorke

REGRETS: Councillor David Hendsbee
Melanie Baker

STAFF: Seamus McGreal, Planner III, Heritage Planning
Aaron Murnaghan, Principle Planner, Heritage Planning
Kathleen Fralic, Planner II, Heritage Planning
David Perusse, Legislative Assistant

The following does not represent a verbatim record of the proceedings of this meeting.

The agenda, reports, supporting documents, and information items circulated are online at halifax.ca.

The meeting was called to order at 3:00 p.m., and adjourned at 5:10 p.m.

1. CALL TO ORDER

The Chair called the meeting to order at 3:00 p.m.

Introductions were held for the benefit of new members.

2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES – May 23, 2018

MOVED by Janet Morris, seconded by Paul Cole

THAT the minutes of May 23, 2018 be approved as presented.

MOTION PUT AND PASSED.

3. APPROVAL OF THE ORDER OF BUSINESS AND APPROVAL OF ADDITIONS AND DELETIONS

MOVED by Paul Cole, seconded by Dereck Bellemore

THAT the agenda be approved as presented.

MOTION PUT AND PASSED.

4. BUSINESS ARISING OUT OF THE MINUTES - NONE

5. CALL FOR DECLARATION OF CONFLICT OF INTERESTS

Paul Cole declared a conflict relating to item 9.2 Case H00462: Request to Include the Kenny-Dennis Building at 1740 Granville Street, Halifax, in the Registry of Heritage Property for the Halifax Regional Municipality. Cole noted that as an employee of the Nova Scotia Public Service Commission, their primary client is the Department of Transportation, Infrastructure and Renewal, who is opposed to the application in Case H00462. Based on this relationship, Cole wished to err on the side of causation by declaring a conflict and not partaking in the discussion or vote on the matter.

Stephen Smith declared a conflict relating to item 9.3 Case H00464: Request for additional financial assistance for St. Paul's Church, 1749 Argyle Street, Halifax. Smith noted that as an employee of Parks Canada, they were concerned about a potential conflict as the matter in question involves a grants program managed through Parks Canada. Based on this relationship, Smith wished to err on the side of causation by declaring a conflict and not partaking in the discussion or vote on the matter.

6. CONSIDERATION OF DEFERRED BUSINESS – NONE

7. CORRESPONDENCE, PETITIONS & DELEGATIONS

7.1 Correspondence

The Legislative Assistant noted that correspondence was received for item 9.2. This correspondence was circulated to members of the Committee.

For a detailed list of correspondence received refer to the specific agenda item.

7.2 Petitions - None

7.3 Presentations -None

8. INFORMATION ITEMS BROUGHT FORWARD – NONE

9. REPORTS/DISCUSSION

9.1 Blasting By-law B-600 – Staff Presentation

Peter Duncan, Manager of Infrastructure Planning, provided the Committee with a presentation on Blasting By-law B-600. They outlined the background and details of the operation of the By-law, noting that it prescribes threshold limits relating to the level of noise, and the shockwave produced by blasting. It also sets out minimum requirements for insurance coverage as well as offences for the violation of the By-law.

Responding to questions from members of the Committee, Duncan noted that the current insurance coverage required under the By-law is \$2 million.

Janet Morris expressed concern that the \$2 million minimum coverage was insufficient, particularly for heritage properties. They also cited additional concerns relating to the prescribed threshold limits, the inadequacy of public consultation, the potential invasion of privacy for the property owners affected, and the fact that Inspectors under the By-law have the discretion to permit blasting that exceeds the threshold limits.

MOVED by Janet Morris, seconded by William Breckenridge

THAT the Heritage Advisory Committee recommend that the Community Planning and Economic Development Standing Committee request a staff report reviewing Blasting By-law B-600 to examine the impact of blasting on heritage properties, as well as identifying and incorporating adequate measures to mitigate damage to heritage properties caused by blasting.

MOTION PUT AND PASSED.

9.2 Case H00462: Request to Include the Kenny-Dennis Building at 1740 Granville Street, Halifax, in the Registry of Heritage Property for the Halifax Regional Municipality

The following was before the Committee:

- A staff recommendation report dated September 9, 2018
- A staff presentation on Case H00462: Request to Include the Kenny-Dennis Building at 1740 Granville Street, Halifax, in the Registry of Heritage Property for the Halifax Regional Municipality
- Correspondence submitted by Paul Armstrong

Having declared a potential conflict of interest, Paul Cole took a seat away from the table for the duration of the discussion on item 9.2, and did not participate in the discussion or vote.

Seamus McGreal, Planner III, provided the Committee with a presentation on Case H00462: Request to Include the Kenny-Dennis Building at 1740 Granville Street, Halifax, in the Registry of Heritage Property for the Halifax Regional Municipality. Noting that it was a third-party application, McGreal outlined the specifics of the property as well as the evaluation criteria. They further noted that should the Committee award a score of more than 50 points under the evaluation criteria, then it is recommended that the Committee forward a recommendation to Regional Council for the inclusion of the property in the Heritage Registry.

The Committee proceeded to score the subject property using the evaluation criteria provided, resulting in the following scores:

1. **Age:** The Committee noted that the Kenny-Dennis building was originally constructed in 1841 with two prominent additions being added in 1863. Using the scoring criteria, the Committee placed the structure within the time period from Boom to Confederation. Based on the above considerations, the Committee agreed upon a score of **16/25**.

2. **Historical or Architectural Importance:** The Committee noted that the building has significant associations with the Kenny family, as well as with the Dennis family. They noted in particular the association of the building with the history of the Chronicle Herald and Mail-Star; institutions agreed to be of national significance. The Committee also noted the building's association to Edward Kenny, former Mayor of Halifax, member of the Legislative Council of Nova Scotia, Canadian Senator, and cabinet member in the government Sir John A. MacDonald. They additionally noted the building's association with William Dennis, former Canadian Senator. Based on these considerations, the Committee agreed that the building was intimately related to figures and institutions of national significance. The Committee agreed on a score of **18/20**.
3. **Significance of Architect/Builder:** The Committee noted the involvement of David Stirling as well as George Henry Jost, among others, in the design and construction of the building. The Committee noted that the Architects were known for their association to other significant buildings within the Province as well as in Ontario. On the basis of these considerations, the Committee agreed that the Architects were nationally significant, and awarded a score of **7/10**.
4. **Architectural Merit:**
 - A. **Construction Type/Building Technology:** The Committee noted that the building has Edwardian additions built on a Mid-Victorian building. They further noting the rarity of materials, such as steel and concrete, being used during the Edwardian period. Based on these considerations, the Committee agreed that it was a vary rare/early example, giving it a score of **7/10**.
 - B. **Style:** The Committee noted the stone façades and classical symmetry of the original building. They further noted the central arched entrance, and the Edwardian addition to the Victorian building. Based on these considerations, the Committee agreed that it is a moderately rare/early example, giving it a score of **6/10**.
5. **Architectural Integrity:** The Committee noted the excellent condition of the architectural integrity of the 1863 building, with no significant additions being made after the 1912 redevelopment. On this basis, the Committee agreed that the architectural integrity of the building is intact and largely unchanged, giving it a score of **13/15**.
6. **Relationship to Surrounding Area:** The Committee agreed that the building is an important architectural asset contributing to the heritage character of the surrounding area; particularly its relation to Province House as well as Barrington Street. Based on these considerations, the Committee agreed on a score of **10/10**.
7. **TOTAL: 77/100**

MOVED by Jenny Lugar, seconded by Janet Morris

THAT the Heritage Advisory Committee recommend that Regional Council:

1. **Set a date for a heritage hearing to consider the inclusion of the subject property in the registry of heritage property for the Halifax Regional Municipality; and**
2. **Approve the request to include 1740 Granville Street in the Registry of Heritage Property for the Halifax Regional Municipality, as shown on Map 1 of the staff report dated September 9, 2018, as a municipal heritage property.**

MOTION PUT AND PASSED.

Councillor Zurawski left the meeting at 4:49 p.m.

Paul Cole rejoined the meeting table at 4:49 p.m.

9.3 Case H00464 - Request for additional financial assistance for St. Paul's Church, 1749 Argyle Street, Halifax

The following was before the Committee:

- A staff recommendation report dated August 23, 2018
- A staff presentation on Case H00464 - Request for additional financial assistance for St. Paul's Church, 1749 Argyle Street, Halifax

Having declared a conflict of interest, Stephen Smith took a seat away from the table for the duration of the discussion on item 9.3, and did not participate in the discussion or vote.

Aaron Murnaghan, Principle Planner, provided the Committee with a presentation on Case H00464 - Request for additional financial assistance for St. Paul's Church, 1749 Argyle Street, Halifax.

Responding to questions from members of the Committee, Murnaghan noted that the project at St. Paul's Church is an ongoing matter and additional funds will be identified when they become available through the cost sharing arrangement.

MOVED by Jenny Lugar, seconded by Derek Bellmore

THAT the Heritage Advisory Committee recommend that Regional Council:

- 1. Approve the provision of in-kind financial assistance of a value up to but not exceeding \$150,000, with a net municipal project cost up to but not exceeding \$75,000, to the Parish of St. Paul's for the continued restoration of a portion of the perimeter ironstone wall and cast iron fencing surrounding St. Paul's Church in accordance with the Heritage Agreement dated November 24, 2017 and the proposed amendments thereto, with funding as outlined in the Financial implications section of the staff report dated August 23, 2018, conditional on:**
 - a. The execution of an amendment to the Heritage Agreement dated November 24, 2017, and its registration at the Land Registry Office; and**
 - b. The execution of a Contribution Agreement with the Government of Canada;**
- 2. Authorize the CAO to negotiate, and the Mayor and Clerk to execute, an amending agreement to the November 24, 2017 Heritage Agreement between HRM and the Parish of St. Paul's, to include:**
 - a. The provision of in-kind financial assistance of a value up to but not exceeding \$150,000, with a net municipal project cost up to but not exceeding \$75,000, for the continued restoration of a portion of the perimeter ironstone wall and cast iron fencing surrounding St. Paul's Church, subject to the execution of a Contribution Agreement between HRM and the Government of Canada;**
 - b. The identification of the new area to be restored in accordance with Map 1; and**
 - c. The completion date of the new work, being no later than March 31, 2019.**

MOTION PUT AND PASSED.

William Breckenridge left the meeting at 5:00 p.m.

Stephen Smith returned to the table at 5:00 p.m.

9.4 Case 21524: Application for a Development Agreement, 33-35 Pleasant Street, Dartmouth

The following was before the Committee:

- A staff recommendation report dated September 14, 2018

- A staff presentation on Case 21524: Application for a Development Agreement, 33-35 Pleasant Street, Dartmouth

Kathleen Fralic, Planner II, provided the Committee with a presentation on Case 21524: Application for a Development Agreement, 33-35 Pleasant Street, Dartmouth. Fralic explained that the Applicant is seeking approval for a sixth unit at 33-35 Pleasant Street to be legalized, as it was determined in 2016 that only five (5) of the units were considered legal under the Land-use by-law.

MOVED by Stephen Smith, seconded by Lois Yorke

THAT the Heritage Advisory Committee recommend that Harbour East-Marine Drive Community Council:

- 1. Give notice of motion to consider the proposed development agreement, as set out in Attachment A of the staff report dated September 14, 2018, to legalize an existing sixth dwelling unit at 33-35 Pleasant Street and schedule a public hearing;**
- 2. Approve the proposed development agreement, which shall be substantially of the same form as set out in Attachment A of the staff report dated September 14, 2018; and**
- 3. Require the agreement be signed by the property owner within 120 days, or any extension thereof granted by Council on request of the property owner, from the date of final approval by Council and any other bodies as necessary, including applicable appeal periods, whichever is later; otherwise this approval will be void and obligations arising hereunder shall be at an end.**

MOTION PUT AND PASSED.

10. MOTIONS - NONE

11. HCD STAKEHOLDER STEERING COMMITTEES UPDATES (Verbal) - NONE

12. ADDED ITEMS - NONE

13. DATE OF NEXT MEETING – October 24, 2018

14. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 5:10 p.m.

David Perusse
Legislative Assistant