



**HERITAGE ADVISORY COMMITTEE  
SPECIAL MEETING MINUTES  
December 12, 2018**

**PRESENT:** Jenny Lugar, Acting Chair  
Councillor David Hendsbee  
Councillor Sam Austin  
Derek Bellemore  
Patrick Connor  
Jennifer Clarke-Hines  
Marisha Caswell  
Stephen Smith  
Lois Yorke

**REGRETS:** William Breckenridge  
Paul Cole

**STAFF:** Seamus McGreal, Planner III, Heritage Planning  
Aaron Murnaghan, Principle Planner, Heritage Planning  
David Perusse, Legislative Assistant

*The following does not represent a verbatim record of the proceedings of this meeting.*

*The agenda, reports, supporting documents, and information items circulated are online at [halifax.ca](http://halifax.ca).*

*The meeting was called to order at 1:34 p.m., and adjourned at 3:38 p.m.*

## **1. CALL TO ORDER**

The Acting Chair called the meeting to order at 1:34 p.m.

Introductions were held for the benefit of new members.

## **2. APPROVAL OF THE ORDER OF BUSINESS**

MOVED by Derek Bellemore, seconded by Marisha Caswell

**THAT the agenda be approved as presented.**

**MOTION PUT AND PASSED.**

## **3. CALL FOR DECLARATION OF CONFLICT OF INTERESTS - NONE**

### **4. Case H00456: Substantial Alterations to municipally registered heritage properties at 5969 College Street and 1452 & 1456 Carlton Street, Halifax**

The following items were before the Committee:

- A staff recommendation report dated November 9, 2018
- A staff presentation on Case H00456: Substantial Alterations to municipally registered heritage properties at 5969 College Street and 1452 & 1456 Carlton Street, Halifax
- Correspondence submitted by Elizabeth Precious, Odessa Spore, Sara Krik, Richard Mueller, Janet Maybee, Graham Read, Rebecca Robertson, Molly De Shong, Omri Haiven, Judith Fingard, Judy Haiven, Peggy Cameron, and Phil Pacey.

Aaron Murnaghan, Principle Planner, Heritage Planning, provided the Committee with a brief orientation presentation on the *Heritage Property Act*, and the mandate of the Heritage Advisory Committee for the benefit of new members. Murnaghan additionally provided a brief overview of Cases 20218 and 20761 and how they related to the substantial alteration cases H00456 and H00461.

Seamus McGreal, Planner III, Heritage Planning, provide the Committee with a presentation on Case H00456: Substantial Alterations to municipally registered heritage properties at 5969 College Street and 1452 & 1456 Carlton Street, Halifax. McGreal noted the rarity of a restoration application like the one currently in front of the Committee, further noting that a “substantive alteration” means any action that affects or alters the “character-defining elements” of a heritage property.

Responding to questions from members of the Committee, McGreal noted that the necessity of re-registering the building as a heritage property once it is relocated is a procedural formality. They further clarified that under the *Heritage Property Act*, conditions can be placed on an approved substantial alternation, which include a requirement that it be re-registered as a heritage property. These requirements would be listed on the property’s title in the Land Registry. They added that the Municipality also has the ability under the *Act* to initiate an application for heritage registration.

MOVED by Councillor Austin, seconded by Patrick Connor

**THAT the Heritage Advisory Committee recommend that Regional Council:**

- 1. Approve the substantial alteration of 5969 College Street, known as the Gold Cure Institute building, as proposed in the staff report dated November 9, 2018 with the following conditions:**
  - a. The property owner agrees to register the buildings, currently located at 5969 College Street, and 5963 College Street, as municipal heritage properties after these buildings are relocated to a new property; and**

**b. The Municipality will consider the deregistration of the property at 5969 College Street after the building (the Gold Cure Institute Building) is relocated to a new lot on the same street and an application is submitted for its registration as a new municipal heritage property.**

2. **Approve the substantial alteration of 1452 Carlton Street, Early Victorian Streetscape, as proposed in the staff report dated November 9, 2018; and**
3. **Approve the substantial alteration of 1456 Carlton Street, Early Victorian Streetscape, as proposed in the staff report dated November 9, 2018.**

**MOTION PUT AND PASSED.**

**5. Case H00461: Substantial Alteration to municipally registered heritage properties at 1478, 1480, 1484 and 1494 Carlton Street, Halifax**

The following items were before the Committee:

- A staff recommendation report dated November 9, 2018
- A staff presentation on Case H00461: Substantial Alteration to municipally registered heritage properties at 1478, 1480, 1484 and 1494 Carlton Street, Halifax
- Correspondence submitted by Elizabeth Precious, Odessa Spore, Sara Krik, Richard Mueller, Janet Maybee, Graham Read, Rebecca Robertson, Molly De Shong, Omri Haiven, Judith Fingard, Judy Haiven, Peggy Cameron, and Phil Pacey.

Aaron Murnaghan, Principle Planner, Heritage Planning, provided the Committee with a presentation on Case H00461: Substantial Alteration to municipally registered heritage properties at 1478, 1480, 1484 and 1494 Carlton Street, Halifax. Murnaghan provided a brief overview of the four properties covered under the application; being 1478, 1480, 1484 and 1494 Carlton Street.

Responding to questions from members of the Committee, Murnaghan noted that 5950 Spring Garden Road, the structure annexed to 1494 Carlton Street which will be demolished under the proposed substantial alteration, is not considered a “character defining element” of the property. Thus, it would not violate the *Heritage Property Act* if the annexed structure were removed.

Several members of the Committee expressed concern with the proposed demolition of 5950 Spring Garden Road, noting that it is a structure with significant heritage value in its own right, and that its removal would be a blow to the historic streetscape of Spring Garden Road.

MOVED by Councillor Hendsbee, seconded by Councillor Austin

**THAT the Heritage Advisory Committee recommend that Regional Council:**

1. **Approve the substantial alteration of 1478 Carlton Street, Early Victorian Streetscape, as proposed in the staff report dated November 9, 2018;**
2. **Approve the substantial alteration of 1480 Carlton Street, Early Victorian Streetscape, as proposed in the staff report dated November 9, 2018;**
3. **Approve the substantial alteration of 1484 Carlton Street, Early Victorian Streetscape, as proposed in the staff report dated November 9, 2018; and**
4. **Approve the substantial alteration of 1494 Carlton Street, Early Victorian Streetscape, as proposed in the staff report dated November 9, 2018.**

After discussing the concerns with 1494 Carlton Street, Marisha Caswell suggested that the vote on the staff recommendation be split so the Committee votes on each part separately.

MOVED by Jennifer Clarke-Hines, seconded by Marisha Caswell

**THAT the staff recommendation for Case H00461 be split so that the Heritage Advisory Committee votes on each part of the motion individually.**

**MOTION PUT AND PASSED.**

The Committee then proceeded to vote on each part of the motion as follows:

MOVED by Councillor Hendsbee, seconded by Councillor Austin

**THAT the Heritage Advisory Committee recommend that Regional Council approve the substantial alteration of 1478 Carlton Street, Early Victorian Streetscape, as proposed in the staff report dated November 9, 2018.**

**MOTION PUT AND PASSED.**

MOVED by Councillor Hendsbee, seconded by Councillor Austin

**THAT the Heritage Advisory Committee recommend that Regional Council approve the substantial alteration of 1480 Carlton Street, Early Victorian Streetscape, as proposed in the staff report dated November 9, 2018.**

**MOTION PUT AND PASSED.**

MOVED by Councillor Hendsbee, seconded by Councillor Austin

**THAT the Heritage Advisory Committee recommend that Regional Council approve the substantial alteration of 1484 Carlton Street, Early Victorian Streetscape, as proposed in the staff report dated November 9, 2018.**

**MOTION PUT AND PASSED.**

MOVED by Councillor Hendsbee, seconded by Councillor Austin

**THAT the Heritage Advisory Committee recommend that Regional Council approve the substantial alteration of 1494 Carlton Street, Early Victorian Streetscape, as proposed in the staff report dated November 9, 2018.**

**MOTION PUT AND DEFEATED.**

Members of the Committee then discussed a possible alternative motion relating to 1494 Carlton Street, with many agreeing with the proposed restoration to the property, but taking issue with 5950 Spring Garden Road being demolished.

The Committee recessed at 3:02 p.m. and reconvened at 3:15 p.m.

MOVED by Marisha Caswell, seconded by Derek Bellemore

**THAT the Heritage Advisory Committee recommend that Halifax Regional Council approve the substantial alteration of 1494 Carlton Street, Early Victorian Streetscape as proposed in the staff report dated November 9, 2018, conditional on the building currently at 5950 Spring Garden Road being considered as a character defining element through a heritage registration application.**

**MOTION PUT AND PASSED.**

**6. Old South Suburb Steering Committee Appointment**

The following was before the Committee:

- Staff presentation titled Old South Suburb Heritage Conservation District

McGreal provided the Committee with a presentation on the Old South Suburb Stakeholder Steering Committee. They noted that the two (2) seats on the Stakeholder Steering Committee for appointed members of the Heritage Advisory Committee are vacant; further noting that the Committee now needs to make these two appointments so that the Steering Committee can hold its final meeting in January 2019.

The Acting Chair called for any members of the Committee who are interested in being considered for the appointment to put their names forward for the Committee.

Jenny Lugar and Derek Bellemore indicated that they wished to be considered for the appointment.

MOVED by Stephen Smith, seconded by Councillor Hendsbee

**THAT the Heritage Advisory Committee appoint Jenny Lugar and Derek Bellemore to serve on the Old South Suburb Steering Committee as the representatives from the Heritage Advisory Committee.**

**MOTION PUT AND PASSED.**

**7. DATE OF NEXT MEETING – January 31, 2019**

**8. ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting adjourned at 3:38 p.m.

David Perusse  
Legislative Assistant