

# HERITAGE ADVISORY COMMITTEE MINUTES July 24, 2019

PRESENT: Jenny Lugar, Chair

Lois Yorke, Vice-Chair Councillor Sam Austin Councillor David Hendsbee William Breckenridge

Patrick Connor Marisha Caswell Derek Bellemore Jim Ballinger

REGRETS: Stephen Smith

Paul Cole

Jennifer Clarke-Hines

STAFF: Aaron Murnaghan, Principle Planner, Heritage Planning

Kathleen Fralic, Planner II, Heritage Planning

David Perusse, Legislative Assistant

The following does not represent a verbatim record of the proceedings of this meeting.

The agenda, reports, supporting documents, and information items circulated are online at halifax.ca.

The meeting was called to order at 3:02 p.m., and adjourned at 4:18 p.m.

## 1. CALL TO ORDER

The Chair called the meeting to order at 3:02 p.m. in Halifax Hall, City Hall, 1841 Argyle Street, Halifax.

# 2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES - June 5, 2019

MOVED by Jim Ballinger, seconded by Lois Yorke

THAT the minutes of June 5, 2019 be approved as presented.

MOTION PUT AND PASSED.

# 3. APPROVAL OF THE ORDER OF BUSINESS AND APPROVAL OF ADDITIONS AND DELETIONS

MOVED by Derek Bellemore, seconded by Councillor Austin

THAT the agenda be approved as presented.

MOTION PUT AND PASSED.

- 4. BUSINESS ARISING OUT OF THE MINUTES NONE
- 5. CALL FOR DECLARATION OF CONFLICT OF INTERESTS NONE
- 6.CONSIDERATION OF DEFERRED BUSINESS NONE
- 7. CORRESPONDENCE, PETITIONS & DELEGATIONS
- 7.1 Correspondence

The Legislative Assistant noted that no correspondence was received for the meeting.

- 7.2 Petitions None
- 7.3 Presentations -None
- 8. INFORMATION ITEMS BROUGHT FORWARD NONE

## 9. REPORTS/DISCUSSION

9.1 Case H00468: Request to Include 26 Elliot Street, Dartmouth in the Registry of Heritage Property for the Halifax Regional Municipality

The following was before the Committee:

- A staff recommendation report dated June 26, 2019
- A staff presentation titled "Case No. H00468: Application to include 26 Elliot Street in the Registry of Heritage Property for the Halifax Regional Municipality"

Kathleen Fralic, Planner II, provided the Committee with a presentation on Case H00468: Request to Include 26 Elliot Street, Dartmouth in the Registry of Heritage Property for the Halifax Regional Municipality. Fralic provided an overview of the subject property, as well as the evaluation criteria. They noted that should the Committee award a score of more than fifty (50) points under the evaluation criteria, then it is recommended that the Committee forward a recommendation to Halifax Regional Council for the inclusion of the property in the Heritage Registry.

The Committee proceeded to score the subject property using the evaluation criteria provided, resulting in the following scores:

- 1. Age: The Committee took note that the building was commissioned in 1931 and built in 1932. Based on the evaluation criteria, the Committee awarded a score of 5/25.
- 2. Historical or Architectural Importance: The Committee noted that the building in question is an example of a 'bungalow school,' with there only being a few remaining examples in the Municipality. It was noted that the building is highly representative of the inter-war era of architecture in the Municipality. Based on these considerations, the Committee awarded a score of 15/20.
- 3. Significance of Architect/Builder: The Committee considered the architect, Douglas A. Webber, noting that they designed many schools and public buildings in the Province during the same period. The Community agreed that Webber is provincially significant. The Committee also noted that Webber's architectural firm continued to expand across Atlantic Canada following their death, and eventually merged with other national firms to become Architecture 49. On the basis of these considerations, the Committee awarded a score of 5/10.

## 4. Architectural Merit:

- A. Construction Type/Building Technology: The Committee noted that the building is a one (1) storey wood framed structure, which was fairly common at the time of construction. Based on these considerations, the Committee agreed that the building was a somewhat rare example; awarding a score of 3/10.
- **B. Style:** The Committee noted that the building is an example of Georgian-colonial revival style, which is reflected in numerous character-defining elements of the building. Based on a consideration of these design features, the Committee agreed that the building is a moderately rare example; awarding a score of **5/10.**
- 5. Architectural Integrity: The Committee noted that all the main character-defining elements of the building have been retained, albeit with some new materials introduced. For instance, the Committee noted that while vinyl has been introduced for the windows, the original Georgian-colonial revival style was retained. The Committee noted that it is unusual that the building has been able to retain so much of its original style given that it has been a highly used public building. Based on these considerations, the Committee agreed that the building has remained largely unchanged; awarding a score of 12/15.
- 6. Relationship to Surrounding Area: The Committee noted that the building is located in a well-developed residential area and was first built with the character of the surrounding area in mind. The Committee noted the importance of the building to the surrounding area, with the building being centrally located and a focal point for the community. The Committee additionally noted that the current use as a community centre is largely consistent with the building's historical uses. Based on these considerations, the Committee agreed that the building is an important architectural asset contributing to the heritage character of the surrounding area; awarding a score of 10/10.

# 7. TOTAL: 55/100

MOVED by Lois Yorke, seconded by Councillor Austin

THAT the Heritage Adivsory Committee recommend that Halifax Regional Council:

- 1. Set a date for a heritage hearing to consider the inclusion of 26 Elliot Street, Dartmouth, in the Registry of Heritage Property for the Halifax Regional Municipality; and
- 2. Approve the request to include 26 Elliot Street, as shown on Map 1 of the staff report dated June 26, 2019, in the Registry of Heritage Property for the Halifax Regional Municipality as a municipal heritage property.

Members of the Committee noted that there are interior features of the building that they believe should be included as protected character-defining heritage elements of the property, such as the wooden interior floors.

Responding to questions from members of the Committee regarding the ability to include interior features as protected character-defining elements in the heritage registration, Aaron Murnaghan, Principle Planner, Heritage Planning, noted that as the property in question is a municipally owned public building, interior features of 26 Elliot Street are eligible for inclusion. However, they further noted that specific direction should be provided by the Committee as to which specific interior elements they would wish to have included.

Following a discussion among members of the Committee, it was agreed that while there are interior features that should likely be included, the Committee did not have sufficient information before them regarding these interior features, or the financial implications of including them, to make an informed recommendation. As such, an amendment was put forward to be provided with this information.

MOVED by Councillor Austin, seconded by Patrick Connor

THAT the motion be amended to add the following after part 2 of the motion:

3. Request a supplementary staff report examining the potential inclusion of interior elements as character defining heritage elements for 26 Elliot Street.

#### MOTION TO AMEND PUT AND PASSED.

The motion before the Committee was as follows:

MOVED by Lois Yorke, seconded by Councillor Austin

THAT the Heritage Advisory Committee recommend that Halifax Regional Council:

- 1. Set a date for a heritage hearing to consider the inclusion of 26 Elliot Street, Dartmouth, in the Registry of Heritage Property for the Halifax Regional Municipality:
- 2. Approve the request to include 26 Elliot Street, as shown on Map 1 of the staff report dated June 26, 2019, in the Registry of Heritage Property for the Halifax Regional Municipality as a municipal heritage property; and
- 3. Request a supplementary staff report examining the potential inclusion of interior elements as character defining heritage elements for 26 Elliot Street.

# MOTION PUT AND PASSED AS AMENDED.

The Chair thanked Fralic for the presentation.

## 10. MOTIONS/DISCUSSION

10.1 University Ave Fire Station Inclusion in Heritage Registry

The following was before the Committee:

- A request for consideration form submitted by William Breckenridge
- A handout titled "Halifax fire station architect, William B Fidler, was a fireman, carpenter and builder"

MOVED by William Breckenridge, seconded by Derek Bellemore

THAT the Heritage Advisory Committee recommend that Halifax Regional Council request a staff report examining the potential for including 5988 University Ave, Halifax, in the Registry of Heritage Property for the Halifax Regional Municipality.

William Breckenridge spoke to the motion, explaining that 5988 University Ave, Halifax, is an example of one of Halifax's earliest fully concrete buildings, and that it was designed by the same architect for the Bengal Lancers. They noted that the building represents one of the first attempts at a modern fire station in the City.

Responding to questions from members of the Committee, Murnaghan noted that the Municipality has the authority to initiate its own applications for heritage registration.

## MOTION PUT AND PASSED.

# 11. ADDED ITEMS - NONE

## 12. DATE OF NEXT MEETING

• August 28, 2019

## 13. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 4:18 p.m.

David Perusse Legislative Assistant