



**HERITAGE ADVISORY COMMITTEE
MINUTES
November 27, 2019**

PRESENT: Jenny Lugar, Chair
Lois Yorke, Vice-Chair
Councillor Sam Austin
Councillor David Hendsbee
William Breckenridge
Patrick Connor
Marisha Caswell
Jennifer Clarke-Hines
Jim Ballinger

REGRETS: Derek Bellemore
Stephen Smith
Paul Cole

STAFF: Kurt Pyle, Manager, Heritage Planning
Aaron Murnaghan, Principle Planner, Heritage Planning
Kathleen Fralic, Planner II, Heritage Planning
Seamus McGreal, Planner III, Heritage Planning
Simon Ross-Seigel, Legislative Assistant

The following does not represent a verbatim record of the proceedings of this meeting.

The agenda, reports, supporting documents, and information items circulated are online at halifax.ca.

The meeting was called to order at 3:04 p.m. and the Committee adjourned at 5:50 p.m.

1. CALL TO ORDER

2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES – October 23 and November 13, 2019 (Public Information Meeting)

The Legislative Assistant noted that there was a correction to minutes for October 23, 2019 (Revised minutes) related to item 9.2, which included an added paragraph identified on page 4.

MOVED by Marisha Caswell, seconded by Patrick Connor

THAT the minutes of October 23 and November 13, 2019 (Public Information Meeting) be approved as circulated.

MOTION PUT AND PASSED.

3. APPROVAL OF THE ORDER OF BUSINESS AND APPROVAL OF ADDITIONS AND DELETIONS

Additions: None

MOVED by Vice-Chair Lois Yorke, seconded by Jim Ballinger

THAT the agenda be approved as presented.

MOTION PUT AND PASSED.

4. BUSINESS ARISING OUT OF THE MINUTES – NONE

5. CALL FOR DECLARATION OF CONFLICT OF INTERESTS – NONE

6. CONSIDERATION OF DEFERRED BUSINESS – NONE

7. CORRESPONDENCE, PETITIONS & DELEGATIONS

7.1 Correspondence

Simon Ross-Seigel, Legislative Assistant, noted correspondence received for agenda item 9.1.2 dated November 22, 2019. This correspondence was circulated to members of the Heritage Advisory Committee.

7.2 Petitions – none

7.3 Presentations – none

8. INFORMATION ITEMS BROUGHT FORWARD – NONE

9. REPORTS

9.1 STAFF

9.1.1 Case H00469: Request to Include 5381 Spring Garden Road, Halifax in the Registry of Heritage Property for the Halifax Regional Municipality

The following was before the Committee:

- A staff recommendation report dated September 9, 2019
- A staff presentation dated November 27, 2019

Aaron Murnaghan, Principal Heritage Planner, gave a presentation and answered questions for the Advisory Committee. Staff advised the Committee that staff's recommendation is to apply the heritage site evaluation criteria to the Committee's heritage assessment.

Following discussion, the Committee decided to apply the heritage site criteria in performing the heritage evaluation, with a final score of 57.

MOVED by Marisha Caswell, seconded by Jim Ballinger

THAT should 5381 Spring Garden Road, Halifax score more than 35 points on evaluation as a heritage site under HRM heritage property program, the Heritage Advisory Committee recommends that Regional Council:

- 1. Set a date for a heritage hearing to consider the inclusion of the subject property in the Registry of Heritage Property for the Halifax Regional Municipality; and**
- 2. Approve the request to include 5381 Spring Garden Road in the Registry of Heritage Property for the Halifax Regional Municipality, as shown on Map 1, as a municipal heritage area under the Heritage Property Act.**

MOTION PUT AND PASSED.

9.1.2 Case H00470: Evaluation of Potential Heritage Resources in Downtown Halifax – Report #1

The following was before the Committee:

- A staff recommendation report dated September 24, 2019
- A staff presentation dated November 27, 2019
- Correspondence received from Brian Lane dated November 22, 2019

Seamus McGreal, Planner III, gave a presentation and answered questions for the Advisory Committee. Staff provided information and detail regarding policy for the evaluation of heritage streetscapes.

In response to questions from the Committee, McGreal provided an overview of the architectural designs which were common at the time of construction. The Committee elected to read motions for each streetscape separately following each separate criteria review.

The Committee applied the following scoring for the subject properties on Birmingham Street:

Birmingham Streetscape								
Heritage Building Evaluation								
Properties	1. Age	2B) Important/Unique Architectural Style or Highly Representative of an Era	3. Significance of Architect/ Builder	4A) Construction type/building technology	4B) Style	5. Architectural Integrity	Total	
1529 Birmingham	16	18	2	5	10	7	58	
1533 Birmingham	16	18	2	5	10	12	63	
1535 Birmingham	16	18	3	5	10	13	65	
1539 Birmingham	13	18	2	5	10	14	62	
1549 Birmingham	16	18	3	5	10	2	54	
Heritage Streetscape Criteria								
Heritage Streetscape	1. Importance of Individual Buildings	2i) Architecture	2ii) Scale	2iii) Height	2iv) Proportion	2v) Building Materials	2vi) Rhythm	Total
Birmingham	60	14	13	15	14	11	14	141

The Committee rendered a total score of 141 for the properties located on Birmingham Street.

MOVED by Councillor Austin, seconded by Vice-Chair Lois Yorke

THAT...

1. Should the Birmingham Streetscape score more than 90 points on evaluation as a heritage streetscape under the HRM Evaluation Criteria for Heritage Streetscapes the Heritage Advisory Committee recommends that Halifax Regional Council:

a. Set a date for heritage hearings to consider the inclusion of 1529, 1533, 1535, 1539, and 1549 Birmingham Street in the Registry of Heritage Property for the Halifax Regional Municipality to form the Birmingham Streetscape;

b. Include 1529, 1533, 1535, 1539, and 1549 Birmingham Street, as shown on Map 1 of the staff report dated September 25, 2019 in the Registry of Heritage Property for the Halifax Regional Municipality as municipal heritage properties to form the Birmingham Streetscape;

MOTION PUT AND PASSED.

The Chair identified that the owner of the subject properties at 1520-30 Queen Street was present to speak, and the Committee discussed whether to give the applicant an opportunity to address the Committee. Several members noted that the property owner's correspondence did not raise items that they believed were directly related to the Committee's engagement with the work.

Staff noted that if the properties in question received a positive recommendation, the owner would have an opportunity to give a presentation before Regional Council during the public hearing for the heritage item.

MOVED by Councillor Austin, seconded by Marisha Caswell

THAT the property owner be allowed to address the Committee for five minutes in relation to the

MOTION PUT AND PASSED.

Brian Lane, CEO of I H Mathers, addressed the Committee regarding the subject properties at 1520-30 Queen Street. Lane advised that I H Mathers has been in discussions with HRM's Planning and Development department regarding the development potential for the buildings located at 1520-30 Queen Street. Some general agreements have been made and that as of July, the final stages of redevelopment have been met. Lane advised that the Heritage Designation will not help achieve the goal of redevelopment as the condition of buildings are poor. IH Mathers has minimally maintained the subject properties on the understanding that they will be redeveloped in the future.

In terms of Urban Design, Lane advised that the redevelopment plans recommend that there be specific design features to capture spirit of what was originally there. With a heritage designation, the proposed redevelopment would be stuck at a pre-bonus height and would negatively impact the proposed street wall. I H Mathers' intent would be to properly represent the streetscape, but the condition of the buildings has deteriorated to the extent that façade cannot be kept. Lane concluded that with proper architects, I H Mathers could create a streetscape that would retain special features of what is currently there.

Some members noted that the condition of building does not directly impact or diminish its heritage value. The Committee asked that it be reflected in the minutes that the Committee understands its purpose is not to assess whether a property should be redeveloped or not, but instead to determine what heritage value exists, if any, with respect to it's mandate and specific heritage criteria according the relevant policy.

**Heritage Advisory Committee Meeting Minutes
November 27, 2019**

The Committee further asked that it be reflected in the minutes that the Committee received and reviewed the applicant's correspondence and presentation and did consider the subject of the correspondence and presentation to be outside of the Committee's mandate, and the Committee did not consider the condition of the building to be pertinent to the evaluation of the building in the context of an evaluation for its possible registration.

In response to questions from the Committee, staff stated staff is unaware of anything which would prevent the applicant from seeking a demolition order between the time of the meeting and the matter coming forward to Regional Council should the committee recommend that the subject property be the subject of a public hearing.

The Committee applied the following scoring for the subject properties on Queen Street:

Queen Streetscape								
Heritage Building Evaluation Criteria								
Properties	1. Age	2B) Important/Unique Architectural Style or Highly Representative of an	3. Significance of Architect Builder	4A) Construction type/building technology	4B) Style	5. Architectural Integrity	Total	
1520 Queen Street	14	18	2	5	10	8	57	
1526 Queen Street	14	18	2	5	10	14	63	
1528 Queen Street	14	18	2	5	10	14	63	
1530 Queen Street	14	18	2	5	10	8	57	
1532 Queen Street	14	18	2	5	10	8	57	
1534 Queen Street	14	18	2	5	10	8	57	
1542 Queen Street	14	18	2	5	10	14	60	
Heritage Streetscape Criteria								
Heritage Streetscape	1. Importance of Individual Buildings	2i) Architecture	2ii) Scale	2iii) Height	2iv) Proportion	2v) Building Materials	2vi) Rhythm	Total
Queen Streetscape	59	14	14	15	8	13	8	131

The Committee rendered a total score of 131 for the properties located on Queen Street.

MOVED by William Breckenridge, seconded by Jennifer Clarke-Hines

THAT...

2. Should the Queen Streetscape score more than 90 points on evaluation as a heritage streetscape under the HRM Evaluation Criteria for Heritage Streetscapes, the Heritage Advisory Committee recommends that Regional Council:

- a. Set a date for heritage hearings to consider the inclusion of 1520, 1526, 1528, 1530, 1532, 1534, and 1542 Queen Street in the Registry of Heritage Property for the Halifax Regional Municipality to form the Queen Streetscape;
- b. Include 1520, 1526, 1528, 1530, 1532, 1534, and 1542 Queen Street, as shown on Map 1 of the staff report dated September 25, 2019, in the Registry of Heritage Property for the Halifax Regional Municipality as municipal heritage properties to form the Queen Streetscape;

MOTION PUT AND PASSED.

The Committee reviewed the properties located on Grafton Street and applied the following scoring:

Grafton Streetscape								
Heritage Building Evaluation Criteria								
Properties	1. Age	2B) Important/Unique Architectural Style or Highly Representative of an	3. Significance of Architect/ Builder	4A) Construction type/building technology	4B) Style	5. Architectural Integrity	Total	
1545-49 Grafton Street	10	18	5	5	9	15	62	
1560 Grafton Street	15	19	1	5	8	7	55	
1567 Grafton Street	8	19	3	5	9	15	59	
1579 Grafton Street	11	20	7	5	10	15	68	
1600 Grafton Street	15	19	2	5	8	7	56	
Heritage Streetscape Criteria								
Heritage Streetscape	1. Importance of Individual Buildings	2i) Architecture	2ii) Scale	2iii) Height	2iv) Proportion	2v) Building Materials	2vi) Rhythm	Total
Grafton Streetscape	60	8	9	10	10	10	8	115

The Committee rendered a total score of 115 for the properties located on Grafton Street.

MOVED by William Breckenridge, seconded by Councillor Hendsbee

THAT...

3. Should the Grafton Streetscape score more than 90 points on evaluation as a heritage streetscape under the HRM Evaluation Criteria for Heritage Streetscapes, the Heritage Advisory Committee recommends that Regional Council:

- a. Set a date for heritage hearings to consider the inclusion of 1545-49, 1560, 1567, 1579, and 1600 Grafton Street in the Registry of Heritage Property for the Halifax Regional Municipality to form the Grafton Streetscape;
- b. Include 1545-49, 1560, 1567, 1579, and 1600 Grafton Street, as shown on Map 1 of the staff report dated September 25, 2019 in the Registry of Heritage Property for the Halifax Regional Municipality as municipal heritage properties to form the Grafton Streetscape.

MOTION PUT AND PASSED.

9.1.3 Proposed 2020 Heritage Advisory Committee Meeting Schedule

The following was before the Committee:

- A staff recommendation report dated November 20, 2019

Simon Ross-Siegel, a Legislative Assistance, provided an overview of the proposed meeting dates for 2020 and answered questions for members. Staff noted a correction in the attached schedule, that March 27th should instead read March 25th.

MOVED by Jim Ballinger, seconded by Marisha Caswell

THAT the Heritage Advisory Committee approve the proposed 2020 meeting schedule as outlined in attachment A of the staff report dated November 20, 2019.

MOTION PUT AND PASSED.

9.1.4 Committee Appointments Expiring November 30, 2019

The following was before the Committee:

- A memorandum dated November 8, 2019 re: Committee Appointments Expiring November 30, 2019

Staff confirmed that members retain their positions on the Committee until replaced through the completion of the volunteer appointments process.

9.2 MEMBERS OF THE HERITAGE ADVISORY COMMITTEE

9.2.1 Lois Yorke – St. Patrick’s Rectory, 2267 Brunswick Street – Potential for Re-Registration and Inclusion in Heritage Registry

The following was before the Committee:

- A Request for Committee Consideration form from Lois Yorke

MOVED by Vice-Chair Lois Yorke, seconded by Councillor Hendsbee

THAT the Heritage Advisory Committee recommend that Halifax Regional Council request a staff report examining the potential for re-registering St. Patrick’s Rectory, 2267 Brunswick Street, and re-entering it in the Registry of Heritage Property for the Halifax Regional Municipality.

MOTION PUT AND PASSED.

9.2.2 William Breckenridge – 1479 Birmingham Street Potential Inclusion in Heritage Registry

The following was before the Committee:

- A Request for Committee Consideration form from William Breckenridge

MOVED by William Breckenridge, seconded by Vice-Chair Lois Yorke

THAT the Heritage Advisory Committee recommend that Halifax Regional Council request a staff report examining the potential for including 1479 Birmingham Street in the Registry of Heritage Property for the Halifax Regional Municipality.

William Breckenridge confirmed with staff that the property is scheduled for the next round of mass registrations, and it is unlikely that the proposed motion will accelerate the process for the scheduling of a heritage evaluation. Based on staff’s confirmation, the member retracted the motion.

10. ADDED ITEMS – NONE

11. DATE OF NEXT MEETING - December 18, 2019 – if required

12. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 5:50 p.m.

Simon Ross-Seigel
Legislative Assistant