



**HERITAGE ADVISORY COMMITTEE  
SPECIAL MEETING  
MINUTES  
June 25, 2020**

**PRESENT:** Lois Yorke, Chair  
Patrick Connor, Vice-Chair  
Councillor Sam Austin  
Councillor David Hendsbee  
Marisha Caswell  
Jennifer Clarke-Hines  
Sandra Nowlan  
Jim Ballinger

**REGRETS:** David Atchison  
Michelle Maria Dass  
Luke Stock

**STAFF:** Aaron Murnaghan, Principle Planner, Heritage Planning  
Jesse Morton, Planner II, Heritage Planning  
Kurt Pyle, Program Manager Regional Planning  
Simon Ross-Seigel, Legislative Assistant  
Sharon Chase, Legislative Support

*The following does not represent a verbatim record of the proceedings of this meeting.*

*The agenda, reports, supporting documents, and information items circulated are online at [halifax.ca](http://halifax.ca).*

*The meeting was called to order at 3:03 p.m. and the Committee adjourned at 5:21 p.m.*

**1. CALL TO ORDER**

The Chair called the meeting to order at 3:03 p.m.

**2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES – NONE**

**3. APPROVAL OF THE ORDER OF BUSINESS AND APPROVAL OF ADDITIONS AND DELETIONS**

MOVED by Marisha Caswell, seconded by Sandra Nowlan

**THAT the agenda be approved as presented.**

**MOTION PUT AND PASSED.**

**4. BUSINESS ARISING OUT OF THE MINUTES- NONE**

**5. CALL FOR DECLARATION OF CONFLICT OF INTERESTS – NONE**

**6. CONSIDERATION OF DEFERRED BUSINESS – NONE**

**7. CORRESPONDENCE, PETITIONS & DELEGATIONS**

**7.1 Correspondence**

Simon Ross-Siegel, Legislative Assistant, noted general correspondence from Benjamin Carr received for Case H00482 dated June 18, 2020. This correspondence was circulated to members of the Heritage Advisory Committee.

**7.2 Petitions- None**

**7.3 Presentations- None**

**8. INFORMATION ITEMS BROUGHT FORWARD – NONE**

**9. REPORTS**

**9.1 STAFF**

**9.1.1 Case H00482: Substantial Alteration to a municipally registered heritage property at 2438 Gottingen Street, Halifax**

The following was before the Committee:

- A staff recommendation report dated June 5, 2020
- A staff presentation dated June 25, 2020

MOVED by Patrick Connor, seconded by Jim Ballinger

**THAT the Heritage Advisory Committee recommend that Regional Council refuse the substantial alteration of 2438 Gottingen Street, Halifax, known as Victoria Hall, as proposed in the June 5, 2020 staff report and its attachments.**

Aaron Murnaghan, Principle Planner, Heritage Planning gave a presentation to the Committee. This Case will return to the Committee for further input when the Planning Application is presented. The substantial alterations were reviewed highlighting the proposed rehabilitation work. Murnaghan referred members to

the Heritage Impact Statement included in the report. Staff's evaluation of the proposal and recommendations are based on the existing policy and regulations, in particular Standard 11 of the Standards and Guidelines.

The Committee commented that the scale and modern design of the new construction seemed incompatible with the heritage building. Murnaghan confirmed that the developer required 16 stories to reach their investment targets due to the magnitude of the conservation and restoration work required. This height was also influenced by the Citadel's rampart restrictions. Under the Centre Plan less height would be allowable.

The Committee noted that Community consultation to date appeared to be positive. Murnaghan confirmed that further formal consultation will be required in the Development Agreement process.

It was also confirmed that the developer would be eligible for a Heritage Grant of \$30,000 in a 4-year period. After 3 years they could demolish under the Heritage Property Act but there would be little incentive as there is less density for re-development permitted under the Centre Plan.

The Committee noted that there was a risk that Victoria Hall would not be preserved if the substantial alteration was refused. They commended the scope of the restoration work proposed.

The Committee expressed that there was time and opportunity for design mitigation options to be considered. A change in the new buildings design elements more reflective of Victoria Hall would be welcomed.

**MOTION PUT AND PASSED.**

**9.1.2 Case H00484: Request to Include 2500 Creighton Street, Halifax in the Municipal Registry of Heritage Properties**

The following was before the Committee:

- A staff recommendation report dated April 17, 2020
- A staff presentation dated June 25, 2020

Aaron Murnaghan, Principal Planner, Heritage Planning gave a presentation and answered questions for the Advisory Committee. Staff advised the Committee that staff's recommendation is to apply the heritage site evaluation criteria to the Committee's heritage assessment.

Following discussion, the Committee decided to apply the heritage building criteria in performing the heritage evaluation and provided the following scoring:

| <b>Criterion</b>                                                            | <b>Score Awarded</b> |
|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------|
| 1. Age                                                                      | 25                   |
| 2A. Relationship to Important Occasions, Institutions, Personages or Groups | 15                   |
| 3. Significance of Architect/Builder                                        | 0                    |
| 4A. Architectural Merit: Construction Type                                  | 10                   |
| 4B. Architectural Merit: Style                                              | 9                    |
| 5. Architectural Integrity                                                  | 13                   |
| 6. Relationship to Surrounding Area                                         | 5                    |
| <b>Total</b>                                                                | <b>77</b>            |

The Committee rendered a total score of 77 for 2500 Creighton Street.

MOVED by Marissa Caswell, seconded by Sandra Nowlan

**THAT the Heritage Advisory Committee recommend that Regional Council:**

- 1. Set a date for a heritage hearing to consider the inclusion of 2500 Creighton Street, Halifax, as shown on Map 1 of the April 17, 2020 staff report, in the Registry of Heritage Property for the Halifax Regional Municipality; and**
- 2. Approve the request to include 2500 Creighton Street, Halifax, as shown on Map 1, in the Registry of Heritage Property for the Halifax Regional Municipality as a municipal heritage property.**

**MOTION PUT AND PASSED.**

**9.1.3 Case H00480: Request to Include 2539 Agricola Street, Halifax in the Registry of Heritage Property for the Halifax Regional Municipality**

The following was before the Committee:

- A staff recommendation report dated May 11, 2020
- A staff presentation dated June 25, 2020

Jesse Morton, Planner II, Heritage Planning, gave a presentation and answered questions for the Advisory Committee. Staff advised the Committee that staff's recommendation is to apply the heritage site evaluation criteria to the Committee's heritage assessment.

Following discussion, the Committee decided to apply the heritage building criteria in performing the heritage evaluation and provided the following scoring:

| <b>Criterion</b>                                                              | <b>Score Awarded</b> |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------|
| 1. Age                                                                        | 9                    |
| 2B. Important, Unique Architectural Style, or Highly Representative of an Era | 10                   |
| 3. Significance of Architect/Builder                                          | 0                    |
| 4A. Architectural Merit: Construction Type                                    | 3                    |
| 4B. Architectural Merit: Style                                                | 5                    |
| 5. Architectural Integrity                                                    | 13                   |
| 6. Relationship to Surrounding Area                                           | 10                   |
| <b>Total</b>                                                                  | <b>50</b>            |

The Committee rendered a total score of 50 for 2539 Agricola Street.

MOVED BY Councillor Hendsbee, seconded by Sandra Nowlan

**THAT the Heritage Advisory Committee recommend that Regional Council:**

- 1. Set a date for a heritage hearing to consider the inclusion of 2539 Agricola Street, Halifax, as shown on Map 1 of the May 11, 2020 staff report, in the Registry of Heritage Property for the Halifax Regional Municipality; and**
- 2. Approve the request to include 2539 Agricola Street, Halifax, as shown on Map 1, in the Registry of Heritage Property for the Halifax Regional Municipality as a municipal heritage property.**

**MOTION PUT AND PASSED.**

**9.1.4 Case H00481: Request to Include 5988 University Avenue, Halifax in the Registry of Heritage Property for the Halifax Regional Municipality**

The following was before the Committee:

- A staff recommendation report dated April 17, 2020
- A staff presentation dated June 25, 2020

Jesse Morton, Planner II, Heritage Planning, gave a presentation and answered questions for the Advisory Committee. Staff advised the Committee that staff's recommendation is to apply the heritage site evaluation criteria to the Committee's heritage assessment.

Following discussion, the Committee decided to apply the heritage building criteria in performing the heritage evaluation and provided the following scoring:

| <b>Criterion</b>                                                            | <b>Score Awarded</b> |
|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------|
| 1. Age                                                                      | 9                    |
| 2A. Relationship to Important Occasions, Institutions, Personages or Groups | 15                   |
| 3. Significance of Architect/Builder                                        | 6                    |
| 4A. Architectural Merit: Construction Type                                  | 10                   |
| 4B. Architectural Merit: Style                                              | 9                    |
| 5. Architectural Integrity                                                  | 9                    |
| 6. Relationship to Surrounding Area                                         | 10                   |
| <b>Total</b>                                                                | <b>68</b>            |

The Committee rendered a total score of 68 for 5988 University Avenue.

MOVED by Jim Ballinger, seconded by Patrick Connor

**THAT the Heritage Advisory Committee recommend that Regional Council:**

- 1. Set a date for a heritage hearing to consider the inclusion of 5988 University Avenue, Halifax, as shown on Map 1 of the April 17, 2020 staff report, in the Registry of Heritage Property for the Halifax Regional Municipality; and**
- 2. Approve the request to include 5988 University Avenue, Halifax, as shown on Map 1, in the Registry of Heritage Property for the Halifax Regional Municipality as a municipal heritage property.**

**MOTION PUT AND PASSED.**

**9.2 MEMBERS OF THE HERITAGE ADVISORY COMMITTEE – NONE**

**10. MOTIONS/DISCUSSION – NONE**

**11. ADDED ITEMS- NONE**

**12. DATE OF NEXT MEETING – TBD**

**13. ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting adjourned at 5:21 p.m.

Sharon Chase  
Legislative Support